ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

ISSN NO. 2320-5407

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 59857

Manuscript Title: LA DEMOCRATIE OCCIDENTALE A L EPREUVE DES DEFIS CONTEMPORAINS

Recommendation:
Accept after minor revision

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✔		
Techn. Quality			✔	
Clarity			✔	
Significance	✔			

Reviewer Name: Dr. Abdul Haseeb Mir

Detailed Reviewer's Repot

General Overview

The academic article titled "LA DÉMOCRATIE OCCIDENTALE À L'ÉPREUVE DES DÉFIS CONTEMPORAINS" ("Western democracy put to the test by contemporary challenges") examines the contemporary erosion of Western liberal democracies through the conceptual lens of **"dissociation fonctionnelle"** ("functional dissociation")—defined as the widening gap between the preservation of formal electoral-institutional structures and the progressive weakening of participatory, deliberative, and egalitarian democratic functions. Combining longitudinal and cross-national indicators from the Varieties of Democracy (*V-Dem Democracy Report 2025*) and *Freedom House (2025)* across five Western democracies (the United States, France, Germany, Italy, and Belgium) with three theoretical frameworks—gradual autocratization, post-democratic power concentration, and deliberative public-sphere transformation—the article argues that Western regimes are undergoing an internal hollowing-out rather than an abrupt institutional collapse.

A notable strength of the manuscript is its well-structured theoretical synthesis and nuanced comparative framing. By pairing V-Dem's disaggregated component indices (electoral vs. egalitarian, deliberative, and participatory scores) with Freedom House's qualitative assessments of political rights and civil liberties, the author avoids deterministic claims and successfully integrates classical and contemporary political

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

theory (Locke, Montesquieu, Linz, Dahl, Habermas, Rawls, Dewey, Crouch, Piketty, Levitsky & Ziblatt, Lührmann & Lindberg, Sunstein, and Castells) into a coherent analytical narrative.

However, to meet the standards required for final academic publication, the manuscript requires minor revisions to trim repetitive prose, include a concise methodology note, and correct several citation and typographical errors:

- **Reduction of Internal Repetition:** Several empirical data points and theoretical arguments are repeated almost verbatim across multiple sections—for example, the global V-Dem deliberative index drop from 0.82 to 0.71 and the U.S. electoral vs. egalitarian score gap (0.84 vs. 0.67) are introduced on page 3 (lines 90–94), repeated on page 8 (lines 240–242) and page 9 (lines 302–303), and restated again on page 11 (lines 368–369). Similarly, the synthesis of Habermas, Rawls, Dewey, and Sunstein at the end of Section 3 (lines 355–389) largely duplicates the paragraphs immediately preceding it (lines 318–354). Condensing these reiterations and adding a brief summary table comparing the V-Dem component scores across the five Western cases (United States, France, Germany, Italy, Belgium) would sharpen the empirical presentation.
- **Citation and Author-Name Corrections:**
    - On **page 13 (line 412)**, the Conclusion contains an incomplete citation missing the authors' names—"(, 2018)"—which should read **(Levitsky et Ziblatt, 2018)**.
    - On **page 13 (line 417)**, the Conclusion cites **(Crouche, 2024)**, misspelling **Crouch** and misstating the publication year (**2004**, as listed in the bibliography).
    - Throughout the text, author names are inconsistently formatted and occasionally misspelled—including **S. Lidberg** (line 161) and **Stafan Lindberg** (lines 174, 210) instead of **Staffan I. Lindberg**, **D. Zibblatt** (line 191) instead of **D. Ziblatt**, and **M. Castel** (line 359) instead of **M. Castells**, as well as inconsistent use of first initials (S. Lindberg vs. Crouch vs. Thomas Piketty). Additionally, **Freedom House (2025)** on lines 167, 250, and 337 should specify **2025a** or **2025b** to match the bibliography.
- **Typographical and Layout Polish:** Several missing word spaces and minor French grammatical typos need copyediting—including *"Institus"* (line 10), *"cettetension"* (line 60), *"antes"* (line 71), *"Housein"* (line 78), *"cratie"* (line 122), *"StafanLindberg"* (line 210), *"concen concentration"* (line 226), *"agit commet"* (line 254), *"ThomasPiketty"* (line 258), *"visant à analyse"* (line 291), *"de eser"* (line 389), *"plusieurs dimension"* (line 399), *"dynamiqueset"* (line 406), *"coupsd'État"* (line 410), *"institu institutionnels"* (line 454), and stray guillemets (> instead of » in lines 234 and 403, and a missing opening guillemet in line 425).

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Trimming the repetitive sections, fixing the missing/misspelled citations in the body and Conclusion, and completing a careful copyedit will make the manuscript ready for publication.

ACCEPTED WITH MINOR REVISION