ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

ISSN NO. 2320-5407

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 59836

Manuscript Title: THE ESSENCE OF THE REGIONAL HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVESÂ' POLICY CONSIDERATIONS IN THE FORMULATION OF REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT PLANS

Recommendation:
Accept after minor revision

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✔		
Techn. Quality			✔	
Clarity			✔	
Significance	✔			

Reviewer Name: Dr. Abdul Haseeb Mir

Detailed Reviewer's Repot

General Overview

The academic article titled "THE ESSENCE OF THE REGIONAL HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES' POLICY CONSIDERATIONS IN THE FORMULATION OF REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT PLANS" examines the legal nature and institutional role of the Indonesian Regional House of Representatives' (*DPRD*) recess activities and policy-consideration documents (*Pokok-Pokok Pikiran DPRD*) within the regional development planning framework. Using a normative legal research methodology combining statutory and conceptual approaches, the author analyzes constitutional mandates (Article 18(3) of the 1945 Constitution), statutory provisions (Law No. 17 of 2014 and Law No. 23 of 2014), and administrative planning regulations (Minister of Home Affairs Regulation No. 86 of 2017) to argue that DPRD policy considerations must be submitted and screened prior to the drafting of the initial Regional Government Work Plan (*RKPD*), rather than appended after the *Musrenbang* consultation forum.

A notable strength of the manuscript is its clear doctrinal articulation of how representative democracy connects to regional technocratic planning. By framing DPRD recess activities as both an administrative mechanism and a political channel of accountability—while candidly acknowledging practical pathologies such as selective constituent outreach and fictitious recess reporting—the paper builds a

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

persuasive normative argument for integrating process-oriented (technocratic, participatory, political, top-down/bottom-up) and substance-oriented (holistic-thematic, integrative, spatial) planning approaches.

However, to meet the standards required for final academic publication, the manuscript requires several minor revisions to clean up structural redundancy, fix incomplete footnote/reference formatting, and polish editorial artifacts:

- **Reduction of Repetitive Prose:** Across Sections C.I, C.II, and C.III (pages 3–8), the same core arguments—specifically that DPRD policy considerations originate from recess activities, embody popular sovereignty, and are currently inserted into the RKPD too late (after BAPPEDA drafts the plan for the Musrenbang)—are restated nearly verbatim across multiple consecutive paragraphs (e.g., lines 191–198 vs. 252–259; lines 318–325 vs. 333–341 vs. 377–381). Condensing these overlapping passages will tighten the legal argumentation and improve readability.
- **Footnote, Citation, and Bibliography Verification:**
    - Several superscript footnote markers in the body text are either missing or garbled during typesetting—for instance, Note 1 has no corresponding marker in Section A, Note 4 is missing from the *Notes* list on page 10 (jumping from Note 3 to Note 5), Note 5 cites *"Op. cit., A. Pangerang Moenta, p. 5"* without any prior full citation or bibliography entry for A. Pangerang Moenta, and garbled characters appear where footnote markers belong on pages 5 and 6 (e.g., decision-making." for Note 8, broadly as possible. 10, legal form.1" for Note 11).
    - Both the *References* (page 9) and *Notes* (page 10) still contain unedited editorial/translator bracketed notes that must be resolved prior to publication: *"Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia No. 86 of 207 [as stated in the source manuscript]"* (line 433) and *"[the source manuscript states '207'; verify against the original legal instrument before publication]"* (lines 455–456)—which should be corrected to **No. 86 of 2017**.
    - Numerous missing spaces between words in Indonesian titles and publishers throughout the References and Notes (e.g., *"BikameralBukan"*, *"PraktikPembentukan"*, *"PT RemajaRosdakarya"*, *"sebagaillmu PengetahuandalamMembangunanTransparansi"*, *"SuyatnoLadiqi"*) must be corrected.
- **Section Numbering and Minor Typographical Polish:** The top-level headings mix lettered and Roman numeral schemes inconsistently (**A. Introduction:-**, **B. RESEARCH METHOD**, **C. DISCUSSION** containing sub-sections **I**, **II**, **III**, followed by **IV. CONCLUSION** at the same

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Roman numeral level as C's subsections). Additionally, minor typos in the body text—such as *"tothe"* (line 26), *"at particular venue"* (line 176), *"suggestions gestions"* (line 210), and *"Nogroho"* (lines 373, 428, 459—likely *Nugroho*)—should be copyedited.

Resolving the bracketed legal-citation verification note, restoring the missing footnote markers and spacing in the bibliography, and trimming the repetitive paragraphs will make the manuscript ready for publication.

ACCEPTED WITH MINOR REVISION