ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-59595

Title: Cryptogenic Ischemic Stroke in a Young Adult Associated with MTHFR Gene Polymorphisms: A Case Report.

Recommendation:

Accept as it is .....
Accept after minor revision.....
✓ Accept after major revision .....
Do not accept (*Reasons below*) .....

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance		✓		

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strength of the study:

- Presents a clinically important case of ischemic stroke in a young adult.
- Describes neurological symptoms and brain imaging findings.
- Includes cardiac, vascular, hematological and genetic investigations.
- Reports elevated homocysteine and homozygous MTHFR A1298C.
- Discusses the absence of common genetic variants associated with thrombosis.
- Avoids claiming a direct causal relationship between the gene variant and stroke.
- Reviews relevant research and clinical guidance.
- Includes written patient consent for publication.

Weakness of the study:

- The exact homocysteine concentration is not reported.
- Folate, vitamin B12 and detailed renal function results are missing.
- The patient's treatment and long term outcome are not described adequately.
- The clinical significance of the genetic finding remains uncertain.
- The diagnostic workup needs clearer documentation.
- The genetic nomenclature requires verification against the laboratory report.
- The single case cannot establish causation.
- Some grammar, spacing and reference formatting need correction.

Reviewers Comments:

The manuscript describes a 23 year old man with cerebellar ischemic stroke, elevated homocysteine and homozygous MTHFR A1298C. The case is relevant because it highlights the challenges of investigating stroke in young adults. The authors appropriately avoid claiming that the genetic variant directly caused the stroke. Written informed consent for publication is reported, and the manuscript refers to the Declaration of Helsinki. However, important clinical information is missing, including the exact homocysteine concentration, folate and vitamin B12 levels, renal function, treatment details and follow up outcome. These details should be added if available. The authors should also clarify the completed investigations supporting the classification of the stroke as cryptogenic and verify the genetic nomenclature against the original laboratory report. The discussion is generally informative, but some sections are repetitive. Grammar, spacing and reference formatting require correction. Overall, this is a potentially useful case report, but further clinical detail and editorial improvement are needed before publication.

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Previously Published anywhere/Plagiarism check:
A web search identified a 2014 case report of ischemic stroke in a young man with homozygous MTHFR A1298C and hyperhomocysteinemia, as well as later studies examining MTHFR variants and cryptogenic stroke. These publications are closely related, but this does not establish plagiarism. The authors should clarify the distinctive contribution of their case and complete a formal similarity check before publication.