

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-59537

Title: Chest Wall Trichilemmal Carcinoma: A Rare Neoplasm in a Rarer Location.

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
 Accept after minor revision.....
 ✓ Accept after major revision
 Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strength of the study:

- Presents a rare tumour at an unusual anatomical site.
- Describes the clinical presentation of a 49-year-old woman.
- Includes CT findings and the size of the chest wall mass.
- Reports the initial biopsy diagnosis and final histopathological diagnosis.
- Documents metastatic evaluation using PET/CT and brain MRI.
- Describes complete surgical excision with R0 resection.
- Includes clinical photographs, radiological images and histopathological illustrations.
- Reports written informed consent for publication.

Weakness of the study:

- The histopathological criteria confirming trichilemmal carcinoma need more detail.
- Surgical margin measurements and final pathology findings are insufficiently reported.
- The duration of postoperative follow-up is not specified.
- The claim that this is the second reported thoracic case requires updated verification.
- The distinction between trichilemmal carcinoma and proliferating trichilemmal tumour is unclear.
- The abstract and main article contain repeated material.
- Ethical approval is listed as not applicable without explanation.
- Grammar, terminology and reference formatting require correction.

Reviewers Comments:

The manuscript presents a rare case of trichilemmal carcinoma arising on the chest wall of a 49-year-old woman. The unusual location, large tumour size and initial diagnosis of squamous cell carcinoma make the case clinically interesting. The authors describe imaging, metastatic assessment and complete surgical excision, while the histopathological images provide useful supporting material. However, the final diagnosis requires a more detailed description of the histological features distinguishing trichilemmal carcinoma from squamous cell carcinoma and other proliferating trichilemmal lesions. The authors should report the measured surgical margins, relevant pathological findings and exact duration of follow-up. The claim that this represents only the second thoracic case in the literature should be supported by an updated search. Written patient consent for publication and accompanying images is reported. The statement that ethical approval was not applicable should be justified according to institutional policy. The manuscript also contains duplicated sections, inconsistent terminology and language errors. Overall, the case has publication value, but substantial clarification and editorial revision are required.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Previously Published anywhere/Plagiarism check:

Trichilemmal carcinoma and proliferating trichilemmal tumours have been reported in dermatological and surgical literature, including cases involving unusual anatomical locations and diagnostic confusion with squamous cell carcinoma. The manuscript cites earlier reports, including a chest wall case described in 2008, but the claimed rarity should be confirmed through an updated literature search. Similar clinical features do not establish plagiarism. A formal similarity check is recommended, and the authors should verify the originality of the case, the accuracy of all references and the proper attribution of any adapted figures or text.