

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-59535

Title: Impact de l'adoption dans le contexte marocain (À travers des vignettes cliniques du service de pédopsychiatrie, CHU Mohamed VI Marrakech, Maroc).

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
 Accept after minor revision.....
 ✓ Accept after major revision
 Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance		✓		

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strength of the study:

- Addresses the psychological and social dimensions of adoption in Morocco.
- Explains the legal context of kafala under Moroccan law.
- Discusses the experiences of adopted children, adoptive parents and biological parents.
- Presents three clinical vignettes involving children of different ages.
- Highlights attachment, identity development and early childhood trauma.
- Discusses the timing and communication of adoption disclosure.
- Identifies family expectations and parenting styles as relevant factors.
- Emphasizes psychological support and long-term follow-up.

Weakness of the study:

- The literature review methodology and source selection are not described.
- The clinical vignettes lack standardized psychological assessment details.
- Diagnostic findings and treatment outcomes are insufficiently documented.
- Interpretations of family dynamics sometimes exceed the evidence presented.
- Some statements generalize psychopathological risks among adopted children.
- Ethical approval, consent and confidentiality safeguards for clinical cases are not reported.
- Several references are incomplete or duplicated.
- French grammar, terminology and overall manuscript structure need substantial improvement.

Reviewers Comments:

The manuscript explores adoption and kafala in Morocco through a literature review and three clinical vignettes from a child psychiatry service. Its strengths include attention to attachment, identity development, early adversity, parental expectations and the challenges surrounding disclosure of adoption. The clinical examples illustrate different experiences, including adolescent behavioural difficulties and the effects of institutional care before adoption. However, the manuscript does not explain how the literature was selected, and the clinical cases lack standardized assessment details and clearly documented outcomes. Some psychological interpretations are presented with considerable certainty despite limited supporting information. The authors should distinguish clinical observations from hypotheses, avoid generalizations about adopted children and strengthen the evidence supporting key claims. Since identifiable clinical histories involving minors are described, the authors must clarify ethics committee approval or exemption, appropriate consent and measures taken to protect confidentiality. The Moroccan legal discussion should also be checked for accuracy, and the bibliography requires completion and verification. The manuscript needs substantial language editing and structural revision before it can be considered for publication.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Previously Published anywhere/Plagiarism check:

Adoption, kafala, attachment, identity development and the psychological effects of early adversity are established topics in child psychiatry and adoption research. The manuscript cites relevant literature and presents three clinical vignettes, but the references are incomplete in places and one entry appears duplicated. Similarity of subject matter does not establish plagiarism, and originality cannot be determined from the manuscript alone. The authors should verify all citations, identify the distinctive contribution of the Moroccan clinical cases and ensure that clinical material is appropriately anonymized. A formal similarity check is recommended before acceptance.