

Manuscript No.: IJAR-59488

Title: From Vedic Chanting to Classical Music Pedagogy: Historical Perspectives on Music Education in India.

Recommendation:

Accept as it is

Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality	✓			
Clarity	✓			
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr. Mithilesh kumar shukla

Reviewer's Comment for Publication:

This paper examines historical approaches to music education in India, tracing pedagogical features from Vedic chant traditions to Hindustani classical music, including the Guru-Shishya parampara and gharana-based lineages. Using a qualitative historical-textual approach, it synthesizes secondary sources to show how musical knowledge has been transmitted through listening, memorisation, demonstration, repetition, and guided performance. The paper argues that Indian classical music pedagogy has depended on the interaction of conceptual understanding, embodied practice, stylistic enculturation, and sustained mentorship—not textual theory or repetitive training alone. It cautions against reading the historical record as a uniform, unchanged system across periods and regions. The article concludes by considering the relevance of individualised instruction in contemporary institutional music education, where diverse learner aptitudes must be accommodated alongside shared curricular goals, while acknowledging the need for verification against primary sources.

Recommendation: Accept after minor revision.

Detailed Reviewer's Report

STRENGTHS:

- 1- The paper explicitly states its interpretive, non-exhaustive aim and limits its claims to selected historical stages, avoiding overgeneralization.
- 2- The thematic synthesis of secondary sources is well suited to a conceptual, pedagogical review of this kind.
- 3- The paper repeatedly cautions against reading Indian music education as one uniform or continuous tradition, distinguishing pedagogical parallels from direct lines of descent.
- 4- The author openly flags incomplete bibliographic details and states that claims and quotations require verification against original publications before final submission.
- 5- Discussions of gharanas, banis, and Thumri styles are presented as broad descriptions rather than rigid boundaries, reflecting scholarly caution.
- 6- The paper derives transferable principles (differentiated exercises, individual feedback, reflective practice logs)

WEAKNESSES:

- 1- Heavy reliance on unverified secondary sources.
- 2- Despite discussing Vedic chant, Pratishakhya texts, and parishads, the paper relies entirely on secondary synthesis and does not consult primary texts or specialist editions, limiting depth.
- 3- Limited and dated bibliography and Lack of empirical grounding.