

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-59250

Title: Carcinome Papillaire Encapsulé Du Sein : A Propos D'un Cas et Revue De La Littérature.

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
 ✓ Accept after minor revision.....
 Accept after major revision
 Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strength of the study:

- Rare and clinically relevant breast tumour
- Clear clinical presentation
- Imaging findings are described
- Histopathology and immunohistochemistry support the diagnosis
- Associated ductal carcinoma in situ is reported
- Surgical management is clearly mentioned
- Multidisciplinary discussion is included
- Relevant literature is discussed
- References include recent publications

Weakness of the study:

- Long term follow up is not reported
- Detailed immunohistochemistry results are missing
- Hormone receptor results are incomplete
- Final pathological staging is not provided
- Sentinel node procedure failed and its implications are not discussed
- Rationale for mastectomy needs clarification
- Patient outcome after treatment is unavailable
- Ethical clearance and publication consent are not reported
- Grammar and formatting need correction

Reviewers Comments:

This case report describes a rare encapsulated papillary carcinoma of the breast with an extensive associated ductal carcinoma in situ component. The clinical presentation, imaging, biopsy findings and final surgical pathology are presented clearly, and the discussion covers the diagnosis, prognosis and treatment of this uncommon tumour. However, several important details require clarification. Ethical clearance or an institutional approval or waiver is not reported, and written consent for publication should be clearly confirmed. The manuscript should provide more complete immunohistochemistry findings, including the reported hormone receptor status, and should clarify the final pathological stage and margin status. The failure of sentinel node detection should also be discussed. The reason for selecting mastectomy rather than conservative surgery should be explained, particularly because treatment recommendations are discussed extensively. Long term follow up and treatment outcome are not provided. The manuscript also requires careful correction of grammar, spacing, terminology and reference formatting. Overall, the case is interesting but requires major revision.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Previously Published anywhere/Plagiarism check:

An exact title search did not identify the same publication. However, closely related French and international publications on encapsulated papillary carcinoma are already available, including case reports and reviews. A 2025 paper also describes a similar case involving mastectomy and hormonal treatment. The authors should clarify the specific novelty of this case. A formal similarity check is recommended before publication.