

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 59149

Title: LEGAL PROTECTION AND EMPOWERMENT OF LOCAL WORKERS IN VILLAGE-BASED COASTAL TOURISM MANAGEMENT IN SANUR KAJA CUSTOMARY VILLAGE, BALI

Recommendation:

Accept after minor revision

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality			✓	
Clarity			✓	
Significance	✓			

Reviewer's ID: Abdul Haseeb

Detailed Reviewer's Report

The study provides a comprehensive examination of how customary institutions in Bali—specifically the Customary Village-Owned Enterprise (**BUPDA Galang Kangin**) in Sanur Kaja Customary Village—legally protect and economically empower local community members (*krama wed*) through coastal tourism management.

The research is framed within a multi-tiered legal architecture spanning national, provincial, and local levels. At the national level, the study grounds its arguments in Article 27 Paragraph 2 of the 1945 Indonesian Constitution, Law No. 13 of 2003 on Manpower, Law No. 10 of 2009 on Tourism, and Law No. 6 of 2023 on Job Creation. Locally, it relies on Bali Provincial Regulation No. 4 of 2019, Denpasar Mayor Regulation No. 51 of 2022, and local village customary laws (*Awig-Awig* and *Pararem* No. 1 of 2023).

Through this framework, the study demonstrates how BUPDA Galang Kangin operationalizes customary authority into concrete socio-economic outcomes. The enterprise manages major coastal tourist sites—including Matahari Terbit Beach and Bangsal Beach—and oversees revenue-generating facilities such as parking, restroom rentals, MSME stall leases, product distribution, and event promotion. Notably, the enterprise maintains a 90% local labor absorption rate, employing 64 local workers (*krama wed*: 57 men and 7 women) and reserving core operational and managerial roles exclusively for locals. External hires are strictly restricted to specialized, temporary non-managerial tasks (such as external auditing) when

REVIEWER'S REPORT

specific technical expertise is unavailable within the village. Furthermore, net operating surpluses (*Sisa Hasil Usaha*) are directly reinvested into the community guided by the *Tri Hita Karana* philosophy, fully funding local cultural and religious needs, such as local *Ngaben* (cremation) ceremonies.

Finally, the study analyzes local environmental governance under changing regulatory conditions. Following the closure of the Suwung Landfill (TPA), BUPDA implemented localized 3R (Reduce, Reuse, Recycle) waste management initiatives. These include routine "Clean Friday" (*Jumat Bersih*) community cleanups, business cleanliness fees ranging from IDR 500,000 to IDR 1,000,000/month, and TPS3R operations involving organic waste shredders and resource recovery (e.g., converting coconut husks into charcoal).

Suggested Improvements

While the study is empirical, well-structured, and offers valuable insights into customary economic governance, several structural, analytical, and practical enhancements would significantly strengthen its academic and policy contributions:

1. Conceptual Framework & Theoretical Grounding

- **Expand the Theoretical Framework:** The paper currently focuses heavily on regulatory compliance and administrative structure. Incorporating established economic and sociological frameworks—such as Community-Based Tourism (CBT), Common Pool Resource (CPR) Management (e.g., Elinor Ostrom's institutional analysis), or Institutional Isomorphism—would elevate the manuscript's analytical depth.
- **Define Key Customary Concepts:** While terms like *krama wed*, *Awig-Awig*, *Pararem*, *BUPDA*, and *Tri Hita Karana* are central to the study, providing a dedicated theoretical glossary or introductory section clarifying these customary legal constructs would benefit non-Balinese or international readers.

2. Methodological Clarification

- **Methodological Transparency:** Detail the primary and secondary qualitative data collection methods. Explicitly state the number of interviews conducted, key informant selection criteria (e.g., enterprise leaders, MSME owners, local workers, village elders), and the timeframe during which field research was executed.
- **Gender Disparity Analysis:** The dataset highlights that out of 64 employed local workers, 57 are men and only 7 are women. The paper should include a critical discussion addressing this gender imbalance in coastal tourism employment and explore potential customary or operational factors contributing to it.

3. Empirical & Operational Deep Dive

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- **Detailed Capacity Analysis for TPS3R Facilities:** The study correctly identifies waste management bottlenecks following the closure of the Suwung Landfill. Quantifying the exact waste volume generated daily during peak versus off-peak tourist seasons against the actual processing capacity of the TPS3R shredders would provide clearer empirical backing.
- **Financial Reinvestment Breakdown:** While the allocation of *Sisa Hasil Usaha* to *Parahyangan*, *Pawongan*, and *Palemahan* (and specific costs like *Ngaben* funding) is highlighted, presenting a percentage or budgetary breakdown of these reinvestments would offer a clearer picture of financial sustainability.

4. Technical Training & Skill Gap Solutions

- **Structured Workforce Development Strategy:** The study notes a reliance on informal briefings and a mismatch between local vocational education and industry needs. The authors should expand their recommendations to propose formal certification pathways, public-private vocational partnerships, or tailored hospitality modules designed specifically for customary village labor.

Final Acceptance with Minor Revisions