

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 59118

Title: Implementation of Coaching Programs in Improving Competence, Employee Satisfaction and Sustainable Performance in PT. PELINDO.

Recommendation:

Accept after minor revision.

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	✓			
Techn. Quality	✓			
Clarity	✓			
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr. Bishwajit Rout

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

(To be published with the manuscript in the journal)

The reviewer is requested to provide a brief comment (3-4 lines) highlighting the significance, strengths, or key insights of the manuscript. This comment will be Displayed in the journal publication alongside with the reviewers name.

- Significance:** The study is significant because it investigates how organizational coaching relates to employee competence, job satisfaction, and performance within PT Pelindo. Its mediation framework extends analysis beyond simple direct relationships. Particularly important is the evidence suggesting that competence provides a meaningful pathway connecting coaching with performance, while satisfaction does not, offering useful implications for designing more strategically focused employee-development interventions in organizations.
- Strength:** A major strength is the integration of coaching, competence, satisfaction, and performance within one structural model. The study employs PLS-SEM and evaluates direct and indirect relationships rather than limiting analysis to simple correlations. Reporting reliability, R^2 , path coefficients, significance tests, and mediation results provides an empirical foundation from which the manuscript can develop stronger theoretical and managerial contributions after substantial methodological and editorial refinement.
- Key Insight:** The paper's central insight is that coaching does not demonstrate a statistically significant direct relationship with performance, but coaching significantly predicts competence, which strongly predicts performance. The significant coaching–competence–performance indirect pathway therefore deserves greater prominence. Conversely, although coaching significantly improves satisfaction, satisfaction neither significantly predicts performance nor mediates coaching's performance relationship, revealing that different employee outcomes may transmit coaching benefits in fundamentally different ways.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Reviewer's Comment / Report

The paper titled "*Implementation of Coaching Programs in Improving Competence, Employee Satisfaction and Sustainable Performance in PT. PELINDO.*" examines the impact of coaching programs on employee competence, job satisfaction, and sustainable performance at PT. Pelindo. Using survey data from program participants and SmartPLS analysis, it finds that coaching positively improves competence and job satisfaction, though effectiveness depends on contextual factors such as organizational culture and managerial support. The paper recommends aligning coaching with employee needs, providing adequate resources, and fostering a development-oriented culture. It contributes practical insights for human resource management in large organizations while noting the need for broader samples and consideration of external influences in future research.

Suggestions for Improvement:

1. Develop the research gap through a systematic synthesis of recent empirical studies rather than relying mainly on general assertions.
2. Explain precisely why PT Pelindo provides a theoretically meaningful setting for studying coaching, competence, satisfaction, and sustainable performance.
3. Introduce an explicit theoretical framework supporting mediation relationships.
4. Develop a conceptual model grounded in an appropriate HRM theory explaining why competence and satisfaction should transmit coaching effects.
5. Explain how this study advances existing coaching literature beyond merely reproducing established relationships within a different organizational setting.
6. Remove untested research gaps concerning coaching methods and contextual factors unless these constructs are incorporated into the empirical model.
7. Clearly distinguish direct-effect hypotheses from mediation hypotheses and ensure every hypothesized pathway corresponds exactly with the structural model.
8. Present a clean conceptual framework illustrating expected direct and indirect relationships among coaching, competence, satisfaction, and performance constructs.
9. Describe questionnaire development, scales, sources, and response anchors.
10. Explain precisely how the 75 respondents were selected across organizational strata and provide response-rate and respondent-profile information.
11. Assess discriminant validity using HTMT confidence intervals appropriately.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

The manuscript addresses a relevant human resource development issue and provides useful empirical evidence concerning coaching, competence, satisfaction, and performance. Its most meaningful contribution lies in demonstrating competence as a significant mediating mechanism. However, substantial revision is required in theoretical positioning, measurement reporting, PLS-SEM interpretation, hypothesis consistency, discussion, language, and references. Strengthening methodological transparency and aligning conclusions strictly with statistical findings would considerably improve the manuscript's scholarly rigor and publication readiness. Addressing the identified weaknesses will make it suitable for publication in IJAR.

I recommend this paper for publication after minor revision.