

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-59046

Title: Facial and Dental Esthetics in Orthodontic Diagnosis and Treatment Planning: A Contemporary Review

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
 ✓ Accept after minor revision.....
 Accept after major revision
 Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strength of the study:

- Relevant and clinically useful orthodontic topic
- Clear macro, mini and micro esthetic framework
- Good coverage of facial, smile and dental esthetics
- Practical implications for treatment planning are discussed
- Tables and figures improve understanding of key concepts
- References include several established orthodontic sources
- Limitations of proportion based analysis are acknowledged

Weakness of the study:

- Review methodology is not sufficiently detailed
- Literature search strategy and selection criteria are not reported
- No formal quality assessment of included literature is provided
- Some clinical recommendations are presented more strongly than evidence supports
- Several numerical norms need clearer source attribution
- Grammar, spacing and reference formatting require editing
- Recent evidence could be incorporated more extensively

Reviewers Comments:

The manuscript provides a useful overview of facial and dental esthetics in orthodontic diagnosis and treatment planning. The macro, mini and micro esthetic framework is clearly presented and the clinical relevance is well explained. However, major revision is recommended. As this is a narrative review without primary human or animal research, ethical clearance is not applicable, but this should be clearly stated in the manuscript. The methodology should provide more information regarding literature sources, search terms, selection of references and limitations of the review process. Some numerical values and clinical recommendations require stronger citation and more cautious interpretation. The authors should also distinguish established evidence from concepts based mainly on traditional or limited studies. The limitations section is useful, but should be expanded to address the quality and heterogeneity of the available evidence. Grammar, sentence construction, spacing, table formatting and reference consistency require careful correction.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Previously Published anywhere/Plagiarism check:

An exact title search did not identify an obvious publication with the same title. However, closely related reviews and articles on facial esthetics, macro, mini and micro esthetics, smile analysis and orthodontic treatment planning are already published. The manuscript therefore appears to cover an established area rather than a completely new topic. A formal similarity or plagiarism check is recommended before publication, particularly because several concepts and classifications are well established in earlier orthodontic literature.