

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-59037

Title: Emotional Expression as Preventive Medicine: An Ayurvedic Perspective on Ashru Vega Dharana.

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
 Accept after minor revision.....
 ✓ Accept after major revision
 Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strength of the study:

- The topic is interesting and relevant to mind body and cardiovascular health.
- Classical Ayurvedic concepts are discussed in considerable detail.
- The manuscript attempts to connect Ayurveda with modern physiology.
- The literature search sources and search terms are described.
- Classical references and relevant modern studies are included.
- The manuscript clearly identifies limitations and future research needs.
- The comparative tables and conceptual pathways improve understanding.

Weakness of the study:

- Several modern physiological claims are stronger than the available evidence supports.
- The manuscript treats theoretical Ayurvedic concepts as established biomedical mechanisms.
- The reported 4.47 odds ratio is based on one retrospective case control study.
- The review methodology lacks clear inclusion and exclusion criteria.
- Some references do not directly support the claims made.
- The recommendation to promote crying as preventive medicine is too strong.
- Grammar, spacing, terminology and formatting require considerable correction.

Reviewers Comments:

The manuscript presents an interesting attempt to correlate the Ayurvedic concept of Ashru Vega Dharana with modern understanding of emotional stress and cardiovascular physiology. The classical references are discussed in detail, and the inclusion of contemporary literature makes the topic relevant. The methodology describes searches of Ayurvedic texts and biomedical databases, but the selection process, inclusion and exclusion criteria and quality assessment of the literature are not clearly explained. The major concern is that several proposed mechanisms, such as tear suppression causing toxin retention, chronic sympathetic overload and direct development of coronary artery disease, are presented with greater certainty than the available evidence allows. The 4.47 odds ratio comes from a retrospective case control study and cannot establish causation. Ethical clearance is not required for this literature based review, provided no primary human data were collected. The conclusion should be more cautious. Grammar, sentence construction, spacing and referencing also require substantial editing. Overall, major revision is required.

Previously Published anywhere/Plagiarism check:

An exact title search did not identify an obvious article with the same title. However, closely related literature on Ashru Vega Dharana, suppression of tears, cardiovascular disease and the Ayurvedic concept of Adharaniya Vega is already available. The manuscript itself cites earlier work on the association between bowel and tear suppression and coronary artery disease. Therefore, the authors should clearly establish the originality of the present review and complete a formal similarity check before publication.