

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-58930

Title: Use of Mineral Trioxide Aggregate for the Endodontic Management of an Oblique Root Fracture in a Permanent Maxillary Central Incisor: A 15-Month Follow-up—A Case Report

Recommendation:

Accept as it is ☐☐☐☐..

Accept after minor revision ☐☐☒☐

Accept after major revision ☐☐☐☐☐

Do not accept (*Reasons below*) ☐☐☐

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		√		
Techn. Quality		√		
Clarity		√		
Significance		√		

Reviewer ID: JP085

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

This case report describes the treatment of an 11-year-old child with a complicated crown fracture and oblique root fracture of the upper front tooth. The initial X-ray suggested a horizontal root fracture, but later CBCT showed an oblique fracture with displacement of the root fragment. The tooth was stabilized with a flexible splint and treated using MTA. The tooth remained functional and without symptoms during follow-up.

Strength:

1. The case is clinically relevant and interesting.
2. The report clearly explains the patient's history, diagnosis and treatment.
3. CBCT was useful in identifying the fracture that was not clearly seen on the initial X-ray.
4. The use of MTA in an immature permanent tooth is well explained.
5. The case includes clinical and radiographic follow-up.
6. The authors have referred to IADT guidelines for management.
7. The article highlights the importance of re-evaluation when clinical findings do not match the initial diagnosis.
8. The figures help to understand the treatment and fracture.

Weakness:

1. The follow-up period is reported inconsistently as 15 months, 12 months and 9 months in different sections. This should be corrected.
2. The exact reason for choosing MTA obturation instead of other possible treatment options should be explained more clearly.
3. More details about the CBCT findings and fracture healing would improve the case.
4. The effect of the second trauma on the treatment outcome should be discussed in more detail.
5. Some grammatical and formatting errors are present.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

6. The references section appears incomplete; only one reference is visible in the provided text.

Overall assessment:

The article presents a useful and clinically interesting case of a complex root fracture in an immature permanent tooth. The role of CBCT and conservative treatment with MTA is well highlighted. However, the manuscript needs some corrections, especially regarding the follow-up duration, treatment justification, discussion and references.

Recommendation: Manuscript accepted for publication after minor revision.