

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 58918

Title: On Time, Out of Touch: IndiGo's Crisis of Silence: A Case Study.

Recommendation:

Accept after minor revision.

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	✓			
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance		✓		

Reviewer Name: Dr. Bishwajit Rout

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

(To be published with the manuscript in the journal)

The reviewer is requested to provide a brief comment (3-4 lines) highlighting the significance, strengths, or key insights of the manuscript. This comment will be Displayed in the journal publication alongside with the reviewers name.

- Significance:** This case is significant because it demonstrates how an operational disruption can rapidly evolve into a reputational crisis when stakeholder communication is delayed, unclear, or insufficient. It highlights the strategic importance of leadership visibility, transparency, and organisational empathy during uncertainty. The case also raises broader questions about balancing operational efficiency with resilience, accountability, stakeholder trust, and responsible communication in highly complex service organisations.
- Strength:** The principal strength of this case lies in its compelling narrative and clearly defined managerial dilemma. By positioning Meera Sharma between operational priorities, financial constraints, and stakeholder expectations, the manuscript creates meaningful strategic tension. The case effectively illustrates how organisational culture can shape crisis responses. Its contemporary aviation context, strong emotional engagement, and decision-oriented ending provide substantial value for management and communication teaching.
- Key Insight:** The central insight is that silence is not a neutral response during organisational crises. When official communication fails to address stakeholder uncertainty, information gaps can intensify reputational damage and perceptions of organisational indifference. The case demonstrates that operational recovery and transparent communication should not necessarily be treated as competing priorities. Effective crisis leadership requires balancing efficiency, accountability, empathy, visibility, and stakeholder trust under extreme uncertainty.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Reviewer's Comment / Report

The paper titled “*On Time, Out of Touch: IndiGo's Crisis of Silence: A Case Study.*” explores IndiGo's operational crisis following new pilot-rest regulations, which led to mass cancellations. It shifts focus from logistical failures to corporate communication breakdowns, highlighting how leadership silence intensified public backlash. Framed around Meera Sharma, VP of Customer Communications, the narrative details her internal struggle to push for transparency against an executive culture prioritizing cost control and operational focus. The paper effectively captures the tension between operational efficiency and crisis empathy, serving as a compelling analysis of leadership, corporate culture, and reputational risk.

Suggestions for Improvement:

1. Briefly distinguish between documented events, narrative reconstruction, and fictionalised dialogue to improve transparency regarding the case-development methodology.
2. Explain the intended learning outcomes so instructors understand whether the case emphasizes crisis communication, leadership, ethics, or organisational resilience.
3. Explain the airline's operational model with supporting evidence.
4. Separate operational failure from communication failure analytically.
5. Balance dramatic narration with factual organisational context.
6. Explain her accountability for crisis communication decisions.
7. Avoid portraying operational leaders as overly simplistic.
8. Link communication decisions with established crisis-management frameworks.
9. Consider whether the crisis reflects a broader organisational culture problem or a temporary failure caused primarily by extraordinary operational pressures.
10. Examine how passengers, frontline employees, regulators, investors, media organizations, and senior leadership experienced and interpreted the crisis differently.
11. Evaluate the reliability and relevance of journalistic sources carefully, particularly where narrative interpretation depends upon potentially subjective media framing.
12. End with a direct managerial question requiring readers to recommend a specific action and justify it using evidence from the case.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

This case presents a timely, engaging, and pedagogically valuable examination of crisis communication, organisational culture, and leadership decision-making during an aviation disruption. Its narrative structure and central managerial dilemma are strong. However, minor revisions are required to clarify factual foundations, strengthen theoretical and analytical grounding, improve source integration, balance stakeholder perspectives, and present explicit decision alternatives. With these revisions, the case could become a highly effective teaching resource for management education. Addressing the identified weaknesses will make it suitable for publication in IJAR.

I recommend this paper for publication after minor revision.