

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 58837

Title: What makes up an Elite Mentality,

Recommendation:

Accept after minor revision

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality			✓	
Clarity			✓	
Significance	✓			

Reviewer's ID: Abdul Haseeb Mir

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Peer Review Report

Journal: International Journal of Academic Research (IJAR)

Manuscript Title: What Makes Up An Elite Mentality

Overview

The manuscript presents a theoretical and qualitative exploration into the psychological architecture of elite athletic achievement, focusing on three prominent modern figures: Kobe Bryant, Tom Brady, and Cristiano Ronaldo. The author(s) examine how these athletes achieved top-tier performance by analyzing four core pillars: deliberate and purposeful practice, a growth mindset, unshakeable self-belief, and the transformation of external doubt into internal drive. By framing elite mentality not as an innate genetic trait but as a cultivable set of habits and dispositions, the paper argues that elite performance standards can be systematically developed by any committed individual.

The paper begins by contrasting the low statistical probability of achieving professional athletic status with the psychological factors that differentiate top performers. It then systematically analyzes each subject: Kobe Bryant's "Mamba Mentality" as an embodiment of Ericsson's deliberate practice; Tom Brady's career trajectory as a demonstration of Dweck's growth mindset under adversity; and Cristiano Ronaldo's extreme self-discipline and structural self-belief forged through early social hardship. The manuscript concludes by synthesizing these case studies into a cohesive framework for performance psychology.

Overall, the paper is well-written, engaging, and successfully bridges athletic case studies with established psychological theories such as Ericsson's deliberate practice and Dweck's growth mindset.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

The narrative structure is clear, and the overarching argument is logically constructed. The manuscript offers valuable insights for sports psychology, performance studies, and personal development. However, minor enhancements regarding theoretical integration, methodological transparency, and literature contextualization would further strengthen the academic rigor of the publication.

Detailed Recommendations for Improvement

1. Methodological Scaffolding & Selection Transparency

- Case Selection Justification:** While Bryant, Brady, and Ronaldo are exemplary figures, the author(s) should briefly justify why these specific three individuals were chosen over elite athletes from individual sports (e.g., tennis, gymnastics, or track and field). Clarifying whether team-sport dynamics influence their psychological architecture would provide greater depth.
- Analytical Framework:** Explicitly outline the qualitative or historiographical framework used to analyze the secondary sources, anecdotes, and quotes cited throughout the text to strengthen the paper's academic grounding.

2. Theoretical Integration & Literature Expansion

- Expansion of Psychological References:** The text cites foundational works by Ericsson, Dweck, and Csikszentmihalyi in the body and reference list. Integrating additional contemporary sports psychology research regarding grit (e.g., Angela Duckworth) or self-determination theory (Deci & Ryan) would deepen the theoretical foundation.
- Nuance on Deliberate Practice vs. Innate Capacity:** While the essay argues that an elite mentality is purely cultivable, addressing the nuance of baseline physical predispositions alongside deliberate practice would offer a more balanced perspective on human performance limits.

3. Structural & Presentation Refinements

- Section Formatting:** Ensure consistent academic formatting for quotes and anecdotal references. Explicitly attributing anecdotal stories (such as Team USA trainer Robert's account of Bryant or Bruce Arians' observations of Brady) with primary citations will enhance scholarly authority.
- Comparative Matrix:** Consider adding a concise table summarizing the psychological pillars across the three athletes (e.g., Primary Mindset Focus, Response to Adversity, Daily Practice Habit) to make the comparative synthesis immediately scannable for readers.

Final Recommendation

Decision: Accept with Minor Revisions

Note to the Editor

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Editor Note: The manuscript titled "*What Makes Up An Elite Mentality*" provides an insightful narrative analysis of elite performance psychology through the lens of modern sporting icons. The manuscript connects real-world athletic achievements with psychological frameworks like deliberate practice and growth mindset.

The paper is well-crafted, articulate, and offers valuable conceptual insights. The recommended revisions are minor, focusing primarily on formalizing the qualitative framework, expanding theoretical citations, and ensuring precise citation of secondary accounts. Addressing these points will enhance the empirical depth of the work without altering its core arguments. I recommend accepting the manuscript subject to these minor revisions.