

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 58775

Title: Human Resources Development in Asean: Concept and Measurement.

Recommendation:

Accept after minor revision.

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	✓			
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance		✓		

Reviewer Name: Dr. Bishwajit Rout

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

(To be published with the manuscript in the journal)

The reviewer is requested to provide a brief comment (3-4 lines) highlighting the significance, strengths, or key insights of the manuscript. This comment will be Displayed in the journal publication alongside with the reviewers name.

- Significance:** The study is significant because human-resource quality is central to Indonesia's long-term productivity, competitiveness, and sustainable development. Comparing Indonesia with ASEAN economies using HDI, HCI, and global human-capital indicators provides policymakers with a broader perspective on developmental strengths and weaknesses. The study can contribute to regional development discussions by emphasizing education, health, skills, productivity, and human-capital investment as interconnected priorities.
- Strength:** The principal strength is the manuscript's focus on an important and policy-relevant developmental challenge. It brings together three internationally recognized measurement perspectives HDI, HCI, and Global Human Capital to assess Indonesia's human-resource position. The ASEAN comparative orientation is also valuable because it places Indonesia's development performance within a regional context. The manuscript further provides useful discussion connecting human capital with productivity and economic development.
- Key Insight:** The key insight is that Indonesia's large population does not automatically translate into superior human-resource capacity or productivity. The manuscript demonstrates the importance of improving education, healthcare, skills, and employment-related capabilities to convert demographic potential into productive human capital. Its comparative evidence suggests that sustained investment in human development, rather than population size alone, is essential for Indonesia to strengthen ASEAN competitiveness.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Reviewer's Comment / Report

The paper titled “*Human Resources Development in Asean: Concept and Measurement.*” examines human resource development in ASEAN, focusing on Indonesia’s relatively low Human Development Index and Human Capital Index despite its large population. Using secondary data from BPS RI and the World Bank, it reviews indicators of education, skills, income, and health. Findings show gradual but slow improvement, indicating persistent low quality and productivity of human resources. The paper recommends expanding formal and informal education, health assistance for the poor, and increasing educational institutions and job training centres to enhance productivity and support national development goals.

Suggestions for Improvement:

1. Explain why comparing Indonesia with ASEAN countries provides theoretically or policy-relevant insights beyond simply presenting development rankings.
2. Conclude the introduction with clearly stated research objectives or research questions directly connected to the subsequent measurement and comparative analysis.
3. Update the socioeconomic background using the latest available national statistics.
4. Explain why infrastructure investment alone may not translate automatically into improved human-resource productivity and national competitiveness.
5. Provide stronger evidence linking government education, healthcare, and human-capital policies with observed changes in Indonesia's HDI and HCI performance.
6. Organize previous studies according to theoretical perspectives and empirical findings.
7. Explain the relationship between individual capabilities and national development outcomes.
8. Develop a conceptual framework demonstrating how education, health, skills, income, and productivity collectively represent human-resource development.
9. Verify all reported HDI values, rankings, scales, and years against the original UNDP Human Development Reports before publication.
10. Provide a table specifying every HDI dimension, indicator, data source, unit, year, and normalization method used.
11. Describe the data extraction, cleaning, calculation, normalization, and comparative procedures sufficiently for replication by other researchers.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

The manuscript addresses an important and policy-relevant issue concerning human resource development in Indonesia and ASEAN. Its use of HDI, HCI, and global human-capital indicators provides a useful comparative foundation. However, substantial revision is required because of conceptual ambiguity, methodological inconsistency, insufficient research-gap development, limited analytical depth, potentially inconsistent numerical reporting, outdated evidence, and inadequate explanation of measurement procedures. The manuscript should be reconsidered after comprehensive methodological and substantive revision. Addressing the identified weaknesses will make it suitable for publication in IJAR.

I recommend this paper for publication after minor revision.