

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-58738

Title: Impact de la politique d'utilisation des semences améliorées sur la productivité rizicole au Sénégal

Recommendation:

Accept as it is
 Accept after minor revision.....
Accept after major revision
 Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		x		
Techn. Quality			x	
Clarity		x		
Significance			x	

Reviewer's ID: JPR-171

Detailed Reviewer's Report

This manuscript evaluates the impact of improved seed adoption on rice productivity in Senegal using a robust methodological framework combining Stochastic Frontier Analysis (SFA) and Propensity Score Matching (PSM) on a dataset of 617 farms. The study addresses a timely and policy-relevant topic, and the analytical approach is appropriate for correcting selection bias. However, several significant issues require attention. The manuscript contains substantial redundancy, particularly in the presentation of results across Tables 1-5 and their accompanying interpretations, which could be condensed significantly. The variable selection for the SFA first-stage (production frontier) versus the second-stage (inefficiency determinants) lacks clear justification the paper states that X variables determine the frontier while Z variables explain inefficiency, but this distinction is not consistently applied. The interpretation of the Probit model coefficients is presented twice in near-identical wording (pages 12-14), suggesting inadequate editing. The conclusion that ATT (1,331 kg/ha) is significant while ATE (816 kg/ha) is not, revealing heterogeneity, is an important finding but is discussed superficially the policy implications of this heterogeneity deserve more detailed attention, particularly regarding which farm characteristics drive the differential effects. The weak performance of the irrigated zone (zone 3) with zero percent of households achieving the mean efficiency threshold contradicts expectations and requires deeper investigation and explanation. References are inconsistently formatted with many missing DOIs or journal names. The manuscript would benefit from clearer articulation of how these findings extend beyond existing literature on Senegalese rice policy. With substantive revisions to address these issues, this work could make a valuable contribution to agricultural policy evaluation in West Africa.