

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-58667

Title: Analyse de la productivité des terres dans la commune de Bouné (Niger) à partir d'un proxy de Google Earth Engine

Recommendation:

Accept as it is
Accept after minor revision.....
Accept after major revision
Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		x		
Techn. Quality		x		
Clarity		x		
Significance			x	

Reviewer's ID: JPR-171

Detailed Reviewer's Report

This manuscript presents a valuable spatiotemporal analysis of land productivity dynamics in Bouné commune using Landsat NDVI time series and Google Earth Engine, addressing an important topic for Sahelian land degradation monitoring. The study's methodological approach combining linear regression with Mann-Kendall significance testing is appropriate, and the findings regarding productivity reversal between 2002-2013 and 2013-2024 offer meaningful insights. However, significant revisions are required. The manuscript suffers from substantial language issues, including encoding errors (e.g., " "), inconsistent formatting, and grammatical problems throughout. The methodology lacks crucial details on classification accuracy assessment, validation of field observations, and specific parameters used in the supervised classification. The discussion is somewhat repetitive and would benefit from deeper engagement with the literature on Sahelian greening versus degradation debates. Additionally, figure numbers are incorrectly referenced (Figure 2 appears twice), and the conclusion is disproportionately brief. The authors should strengthen the connection between land use changes and productivity trends, provide quantitative accuracy metrics, and significantly improve the English/French language quality throughout. With substantial revisions addressing these methodological, structural, and language concerns, this work could make a meaningful contribution.