

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 58497

Title: **Nature, Environment and Folk Life in Premchand's Stories.**

### Recommendation:

Accept as it is .....

**Accept after minor revision.....**

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

| Rating         | Excel. | Good | Fair | Poor |
|----------------|--------|------|------|------|
| Originality    |        | ✓    |      |      |
| Techn. Quality |        | ✓    |      |      |
| Clarity        |        |      | ✓    |      |
| Significance   |        |      | ✓    |      |

Reviewer Name: **ANAPANA GOPAL**

### Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

#### General Comments

The manuscript examines the depiction of nature, environmental consciousness, and rural life in the stories of Munshi Premchand, particularly *Poos Ki Raat*, *Do Bailon Ki Katha*, *Eidgah*, and *Panch Parmeshwar*. The study highlights the interconnectedness of human beings, nature, animals, and rural society while emphasizing Premchand's environmental sensitivity and ecological ethics. The topic is relevant to Hindi literary criticism, environmental humanities, and cultural studies.

The manuscript is readable and supported by textual examples from Premchand's stories. However, the study remains largely descriptive and lacks a strong research framework, critical literary analysis, theoretical grounding, and engagement with contemporary scholarship. Therefore, **Minor Revision** is recommended.

#### Minor Comments

##### 1. Research novelty should be clearly established

The manuscript discusses well-known stories of Premchand, but the originality of the study is not clearly presented.

The authors should explain:

- what new perspective this study offers,
- how it differs from previous research on Premchand,
- why environmental criticism provides a new interpretation,
- the contribution of the study to Hindi literary research.

##### 2. Research methodology should be described

The manuscript does not explain the research methodology.

Please include:

- research design,
- textual analysis approach,
- criteria for selecting the stories,
- literary analytical framework,
- sources consulted,

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

- limitations of the study.

### **3. Strengthen the theoretical framework**

The manuscript primarily summarizes stories instead of critically analyzing them.

The study should incorporate relevant theories such as:

- Ecocriticism,
- Environmental Humanities,
- Ecofeminism (where appropriate),
- Cultural Ecology,
- Environmental Ethics,
- Rural Literary Studies.

Integrating these frameworks would significantly improve the academic quality.

### **4. Discussion should be more analytical**

Most sections narrate the story contents rather than critically interpreting them.

The authors should analyze:

- symbolism of nature,
- environmental ethics in Premchand's writings,
- relationship between ecology and social justice,
- ecological dimensions of rural poverty,
- relevance to contemporary environmental issues.

### **5. Literature review should be expanded**

The manuscript cites only a limited number of primary references.

The authors should include:

- recent research articles on Premchand,
- studies on environmental literature,
- ecocritical interpretations,
- contemporary Hindi literary criticism,
- international literature on environmental humanities.

### **6. Avoid repetition**

Several arguments regarding:

- human–nature relationship,
- rural environment,
- environmental protection,
- coexistence,

are repeated throughout the manuscript.

These discussions should be consolidated to improve readability.

### **7. Strengthen the conclusion**

The conclusion summarizes the stories but does not sufficiently discuss:

- broader literary significance,
- educational implications,
- contribution to environmental awareness,
- future research directions.

# International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

[www.journalijar.com](http://www.journalijar.com)

---

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

### Minor Comments

#### Abstract

The abstract should:

- clearly state the research objective,
- briefly describe the methodology,
- mention the theoretical perspective,
- highlight the major findings,
- emphasize the novelty.

#### Keywords

Consider adding:

- Ecocriticism
- Hindi Literature
- Rural Culture
- Environmental Ethics
- Premchand
- Folk Life

#### Introduction

The introduction is informative but should:

- define the research gap,
- explain the importance of environmental literary studies,
- clearly state the research objectives.

#### Organization

The manuscript would benefit from dividing the discussion into clear subheadings, such as:

- Nature in *Poos Ki Raat*
- Environmental Ethics in *Do Bailon Ki Katha*
- Rural Ecology in *Eidgah*
- Community and Environment in *Panch Parmeshwar*
- Comparative Discussion

This would improve structure and readability.

#### Use of Quotations

The selected quotations from Premchand are appropriate.

However:

- reduce lengthy quotations,
- provide more critical interpretation after each quotation,
- maintain consistent citation style.

#### Language

The manuscript is generally understandable but requires careful editing.

Several issues include:

- grammatical inconsistencies,
- repetitive sentence construction,
- typographical errors,
- punctuation inconsistencies,

# International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

*www.journalijar.com*

---

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

- spacing problems.

Professional Hindi language editing is recommended.

### References

The reference list mainly contains primary literary sources.

The manuscript would be strengthened by adding:

- peer-reviewed journal articles,
- recent books on Premchand,
- ecocritical literature,
- environmental literary criticism.

Please ensure consistency in reference formatting.

### Strengths

- Relevant topic combining literature and environmental studies.
- Appropriate selection of Premchand's major stories.
- Good use of textual evidence.
- Highlights ecological consciousness in Hindi literature.
- Emphasizes rural life and human-nature relationships.
- Useful contribution to environmental awareness through literature.

### Weaknesses

- Research novelty is insufficiently demonstrated.
- No explicit research methodology.
- Limited theoretical framework.
- Discussion is descriptive rather than analytical.
- Literature review is limited.
- Repetition is present throughout the manuscript.
- References need expansion with recent scholarly studies.

### Recommendation

**Minor Revision**