

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-58480

Title: Quaternary Sedimentation, Toba Ash Beds, Neotectonics and Hominid Evolution in the Narmada Rift Valley, Central India.

Recommendation:

Accept as it is ☐☐☐☐..

Accept after minor revision ☒☐☐☐

Accept after major revision ☐☐☐☐☐

Do not accept (*Reasons below*) ☐☐☐

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	√			
Techn. Quality		√		
Clarity		√		
Significance		√		

Reviewer ID: JP085

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

This manuscript presents a comprehensive geological and paleoanthropological investigation of the Narmada Rift Valley, focusing on Quaternary sedimentation, Toba volcanic ash beds, neotectonic evolution, and their relationship with hominid fossils. The study integrates stratigraphic, geochemical, geomorphological, and paleoanthropological evidence to understand the evolution of the Narmada basin and the impact of the Toba eruption on early human populations. The topic is scientifically important and contributes valuable information to Quaternary geology and human evolution research.

Strength:

1. Original and scientifically significant research.
2. Comprehensive geological and stratigraphic analysis.
3. Integrates multiple scientific disciplines.
4. Extensive field observations and supporting data.
5. Well-supported by relevant literature.
6. Valuable contribution to Quaternary and paleoanthropological research.

Weakness:

1. Manuscript is excessively long and repetitive.
2. Several language and grammatical errors reduce readability.
3. Some conclusions require stronger supporting evidence.
4. Figures and tables need clearer presentation.
5. References require formatting consistency.
6. Discussion could be more concise and focused.

Overall assessment:

The manuscript presents an important contribution to the understanding of Quaternary geology, Toba ash deposition, and hominid evolution in the Narmada Rift Valley. The study is scientifically valuable and

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

based on extensive geological observations. However, substantial revision is needed to improve language quality, reduce repetition, strengthen the discussion with clearer evidence, and enhance the presentation of figures and references.

Recommendation: Manuscript accepted for publication after minor revision.