

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 58395

Title: Surgical Correction of Congenital Atresia Ani in a Bovine Neonatal Calf,

Recommendation:

Accept after minor revision

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality			✓	
Clarity			✓	
Significance	✓			

Reviewer's ID: Bilqees Hamza

Detailed Reviewer's Report

The manuscript titled "Surgical Correction of Congenital Atresia Ani in a Bovine Neonatal Calf" presents a clinical case report describing the successful surgical management of a three-day-old female bovine calf suffering from congenital atresia ani. The neonatal patient presented with classic clinical symptoms of the condition, including progressive abdominal distension, continuous straining, restlessness, and an absolute inability to pass meconium since birth. Under caudal epidural anesthesia, a cruciate perineal skin incision was made to locate, mobilize, and exteriorize the blind rectal pouch, which was subsequently sutured to the skin to establish a patent anal canal. To prevent the common postoperative complication of anal stenosis, a modified 2 mL syringe barrel was sutured into the newly created anal opening to act as a stent during the healing process. The calf recovered fully and resumed normal defecation. While the clinical management of this case is standard and the outcome successful, the manuscript requires minor revisions to address terminology discrepancies, clean up typographical and formatting artifacts, resolve inconsistencies between the figures and their captions, and expand the brief discussion section.

Detailed Discussion on the Suggestions for the Improvement of the Article

A primary issue requiring immediate rectification is the inconsistent nomenclature regarding the animal's species. Throughout the title, abstract, and case description, the authors refer to the patient as a "bovine calf" or "female bovine calf". However, the keywords list "buffalo calf" as a key term, and the introduction mentions that the occurrence is "relatively uncommon in buffalo calves". In veterinary medicine, bovine (cattle) and bubaline (buffalo) species are distinct, and the authors must standardize the terminology throughout the manuscript to reflect the exact species of the patient. If the calf is indeed a

REVIEWER'S REPORT

cattle calf, "buffalo calf" should be removed from the keywords and the comparative reference in the introduction adjusted accordingly.

The manuscript also contains several distracting typographical errors and text artifacts that compromise its professional quality. On line 58, the word "EVIL" is printed as an isolated, random line of text immediately preceding the "Case History and Clinical Examination" header. This appears to be a draft artifact or a leftover watermark scan that must be deleted. Additionally, on line 73, the word "prepared" is misspelled as "repared". The authors should meticulously proofread the text to eliminate such errors before publication.

There is a significant mismatch between the provided figures and their captions. The text lists captions for Figure 1 through Figure 4, describing the absence of the anal opening, positioning, administration of local analgesia, and the passing of feces. However, the manuscript layout only contains two image boxes, which are labeled as Fig. 1 and Fig. 2 but display prominent background watermarks ("IJAR" and "AR"). The authors must either supply the missing photographs for Figure 3 and Figure 4 or adjust the caption list to accurately reflect the figures actually present in the document. Furthermore, all submitted figures must be high-resolution, original, and entirely free of any external journal watermarks or transparent text overlays to preserve academic integrity.

Finally, the discussion section is exceptionally brief and would benefit from expansion. Currently, it consists of a single short paragraph that restates the diagnosis and basic surgical approach without much critical analysis. The authors should expand this section to compare the cruciate incision technique with other standard approaches, such as circular or elliptical incisions, and discuss the specific advantages of using a modified 2 mL syringe barrel as an indwelling stent to prevent postoperative stricture, as this is the most unique practical aspect of their clinical report.

Recommendation to the Editor**Accept with Minor Revisions****Comments to the Editor**

This is a straightforward, clinically useful case report demonstrating a successful and cost-effective surgical resolution of congenital atresia ani in a neonatal calf. The inclusion of a modified 2 mL syringe barrel to maintain anal patency during the postoperative period represents a highly practical modification that is valuable for field veterinarians operating under low-resource settings. However, the manuscript requires minor clean-up prior to publication. The authors must resolve the species terminology discrepancy (clarifying if the calf is bovine or bubaline), remove the bizarre "EVIL" text artifact from line 58, reconcile the missing figures with the caption list, and provide clean, unwatermarked original

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

images. Once these minor presentation and editorial issues are resolved, the manuscript will be a suitable and practical addition to the clinical literature