



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 58237

Title: Agnimandya: A Comprehensive Review.

Recommendation:

Accept after minor revision

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality			✓	
Clarity			✓	
Significance	✓			

Reviewer's ID: Bilqees Hamza

Detailed Reviewer's Report

The manuscript titled "*Agnimandya: A Comprehensive Review*" presents a detailed and timely synthesis that bridges classical Ayurvedic gastroenterology with contemporary biomedical frameworks. The text targets a fundamental pathological cornerstone of Ayurvedic theory, namely *Agnimandya*, which is understood as the impairment of the central digestive fire (*Jatharagni*). By establishing *Agnimandya* as the primary upstream catalyst for systemic *Ama* (toxic, undigested metabolic by-products) accumulation, the authors systematically trace how a localized functional deficit in the gastrointestinal tract evolves into widespread metabolic and systemic diseases. The core objective of this review is to map these traditional clinical insights against modern pathophysiological phenomena, including functional dyspepsia, hypochlorhydria, gastrointestinal motility disorders, intestinal dysbiosis, and chronic metabolic syndrome.

The primary scholarly contribution of this work lies in its structured dual-lens approach. Instead of keeping the traditional concepts isolated within historical terminology, the paper offers an integrative framework that helps modern clinicians understand how lifestyle choices, stress, and poor eating habits disrupt gastrointestinal health. This methodology provides a useful conceptual bridge. It helps recontextualize ancient preventative guidelines—such as *Nidana Parivarjana* (causative factor avoidance), disciplined *Ahara* (dietary intake), and seasonal *Shodhana* (detoxification procedures)—as evidence-based interventions for modern lifestyle disorders.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

The textual design of the manuscript follows a logical sequence, beginning with an exploration of *Agni's* role in sustaining cellular vitality, tissue nourishment (*Dhatu* metabolism), and overall immunological defense. A significant technical merit of the literature review is its careful integration of the sub-types of *Agni*. By explicitly mapping out the thirteen distinct expressions of metabolic fire mentioned by Acharya Charaka—which include the single principal *Jatharagni*, the five elemental *Bhutagnis*, and the seven tissue-specific *Dhatvagnis*—the authors successfully show that *Agni* represents a complex, multi-tiered regulatory network rather than just simple gastric secretions.

Methodologically, the review demonstrates a strong foundation by pulling text directly from classical source texts like the *Charaka Samhita*, *Sushruta Samhita*, *Ashtanga Hridaya*, *Madhava Nidana*, and *Bhavaprakasha*. This textual grounding ensures that the subsequent comparisons with modern medical literature remain accurate to the source material. The comparative sections are particularly strong where the authors align the functional states of *Agni* with specific clinical presentations. For instance, linking *Vishmagni* (irregular fire driven by *Vata*) to erratic digestive states, and connecting *Mandagni* (diminished fire driven by *Kapha*) to prolonged gastric retention and mucosal sluggishness, provides a clear framework for further clinical research.

Furthermore, the section mapping traditional clinical features to modern functional dyspepsia is exceptionally well argued. Finding direct parallels between *Arochaka* and anorexia, *Avipaka* and postprandial discomfort, *Adhmana* and abdominal distension, and *Glani* and systemic malaise helps demystify Ayurvedic symptomatology. This makes the clinical observations accessible to a broader, multi-disciplinary scientific audience.

Recommendations for Comprehensive Revision

To ensure the manuscript reaches the rigorous presentation standards required by, several distinct areas require improvement.

The first recommendation addresses a clear conceptual contradiction regarding the nosological status of *Agnimandya* within the classical texts. In the initial portion of the literature review, the authors explicitly note that *Agnimandya* is described as an independent disease in the *Madhava Nidana*, while being treated as a precursor or contextual state under *Grahani* in the *Charaka Samhita*. However, later in the same section, the text explicitly asserts that *Agnimandya* is not mentioned as a specific disease in classical texts. This direct contradiction weakens the analytical clarity of the historical review. The authors must revise this narrative to clarify that while *Agnimandya* is primarily handled as an underlying pathological state or prodromal phase in earlier texts like Charaka, it later gained independent classification in

REVIEWER'S REPORT

specialized nosological compendia such as the *Madhava Nidana*. Resolving this discrepancy will strengthen the manuscript's historical accuracy.

The second recommendation points out a critical typographical error in the classification of indigestion types (*Ajirna*). In the structural outline of the *Madhava Nidana* classifications, the text mistakenly lists the term *Vidagdhajirna* twice in succession. The first listing is erroneously matched with the predominance of *Kapha*, while the second listing correctly attributes *Vidagdhajirna* to excess acidic *Pitta* secretion. According to established Ayurvedic pathology, the condition caused by the predominance of *Kapha* is *Amajirna*, not *Vidagdhajirna*. The authors must correct this entry to ensure the classification accurately reflects traditional teaching, as this section is central to the diagnostic breakdown of the paper.

The third recommendation focuses on refining the layout and clarity of the comparative tables. The table summarizing the *Samanya Hetu* (general causes) of *Ajirna* across the works of Vagbhata, Sushruta, Charaka, and Bhavaprakash contains several overlapping columns and cut-off text strings, such as "Atimatraahara" and "Atyambupaana", which complicate quick reading. Similarly, the column headers in the *Pathyahara* table contain repetitive placeholder text, notably the double phrase "Properties Propertie". These tables should be carefully reformatted to ensure a clean, professional presentation where terms are fully readable and formatting errors are removed.

Finally, the discussion section would benefit from a more detailed exploration of the physiological mechanisms connecting the gut microbiota to *Samagni* and *Ama*. While the manuscript correctly notes that a balanced microbial environment (eubiosis) mirrors the functional state of *Samagni*, it should elaborate on how specific bacterial metabolites, like short-chain fatty acids, support mucosal integrity and metabolic health. Similarly, the authors can expand their discussion of *Ama* by explicitly linking it to lipopolysaccharide-driven metabolic endotoxemia and systemic low-grade inflammation. Adding these specific details will elevate the paper from a conceptual comparison to a more impactful, mechanistic hypothesis.

Final Review Conclusion

"*Agnimandya: A Comprehensive Review*" provides a valuable, well-researched perspective on a foundational concept in Ayurvedic pathology. It effectively demonstrates how ancient descriptions of impaired digestion align with modern observations of gut dysbiosis, functional dyspepsia, and metabolic dysfunction. The paper emphasizes that health management requires a comprehensive look at diet, lifestyle, and mental well-being, offering a useful framework for preventative medicine.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

The current presentation issues, historical contradictions, and typographical errors do not diminish the inherent value of the authors' work. These issues can be easily corrected by clarifying the text, fixing the classification typo, and cleaning up the tables. Addressing these points will significantly improve the manuscript's readability and scientific impact. Therefore, this article is recommended for publication subject to Minor Revision.