



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-58063

Title: Some of Roman and Hebrew Influences in Ottoman Culture

Recommendation:

Accept as it is

Accept after minor revision

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality			
Techn. Quality		...		
Clarity		...		
Significance	...			

Reviewer's ID: JPR- 180

Detailed Reviewer's Report

The paper "*Some of Roman and Hebrew Influences in Ottoman Culture*" examines the contribution of Roman (primarily Greek and Balkan Christian communities) and Hebrew (Jewish) populations to the development of Ottoman culture. The author argues that Ottoman civilization was not solely a product of Turkish, Arab, or Persian influences, but was also significantly enriched by the cultural, architectural, and economic contributions of Roman and Hebrew communities. The paper highlights how the Ottoman Empire's policies of relative tolerance and administrative inclusion enabled these groups to preserve their traditions while contributing to the broader imperial culture. A notable strength of the study is its discussion of Ottoman governance and its treatment of non-Muslim communities. The author explains how Roman and Hebrew populations were granted varying degrees of religious autonomy, maintained their own institutions, and participated in the empire's administrative and economic systems. The paper effectively illustrates how these policies facilitated cultural exchange and social integration, helping the Ottoman state maintain stability across its vast and diverse territories. The article also provides valuable insights into the role of Roman and Hebrew individuals in state administration, military service, commerce, and craftsmanship. Particular attention is given to the contributions of Jewish communities in trade, printing, metalwork, textile production, and finance. By presenting examples of influential Jewish officials and artisans, the author demonstrates the significant impact these communities had on Ottoman economic and cultural development.

Another important aspect of the paper is its examination of architecture and urban civilization. The author argues that Ottoman cities evolved through the integration of Roman, Hebrew, and Islamic traditions. The discussion of urban planning, religious structures, marketplaces, and public institutions provides a useful overview of the multicultural character of Ottoman urban life. The section on architecture, including references to prominent architects and monumental constructions, further emphasizes the diverse cultural influences that shaped Ottoman artistic achievements.

The paper's exploration of craftsmanship is particularly interesting. The author highlights the importance of carpets, jewelry, ceramics, and decorative arts, suggesting that Hebrew artisans played a significant role in the development of Ottoman material culture. The analysis of motifs, production techniques, and artisan communities illustrates how cultural exchange enriched Ottoman artistic traditions and contributed to the empire's reputation for high-quality craftsmanship.

Despite its strengths, the paper has several limitations. The language and grammar require substantial revision to improve clarity and readability. Numerous historical claims are presented without sufficient critical analysis or supporting evidence, and some demographic and historical figures appear questionable or inadequately referenced. The paper would benefit from a stronger methodological framework, greater engagement with recent scholarship, and more precise citation practices. Additionally, some arguments tend to generalize complex historical relationships without acknowledging scholarly debates on the subject.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Overall, the article addresses an interesting and important topic by emphasizing the multicultural foundations of Ottoman civilization. It contributes to understanding how religious and ethnic diversity influenced the empire's architecture, urban development, and artistic traditions. With improvements in academic writing, source documentation, and historical analysis, the paper could make a more substantial contribution to studies of Ottoman cultural history.