

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 58034

Title: Spatial Umran Theory: Toward a Theory of Umranic Equilibrium for Spatial Development and Regional Planning.

Recommendation:

Accept after minor revision.

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	✓			
Techn. Quality	✓			
Clarity	✓			
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr. Bishwajit Rout

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

(To be published with the manuscript in the journal)

The reviewer is requested to provide a brief comment (3-4 lines) highlighting the significance, strengths, or key insights of the manuscript. This comment will be Displayed in the journal publication alongside with the reviewers name.

- Significance:** The study expands contemporary planning scholarship by introducing a non-Western theoretical lens for territorial development. Its emphasis on multidimensional equilibrium provides a meaningful alternative to fragmented development paradigms. By integrating ethical governance, social cohesion, environmental stewardship, spatial justice, and economic performance, the theory offers a potentially influential framework for future planning and spatial analysis research.
- Strength:** The strongest aspect of this manuscript is its integrative conceptual architecture. The theory successfully synthesizes insights from sustainability, resilience, governance, competitiveness, and spatial justice into a unified explanatory framework. The introduction of Umranic Equilibrium and the proposed Spatial Umran Index significantly strengthen the manuscript's originality and future empirical potential.
- Key Insight:** The paper's central insight is that territorial flourishing does not emerge from maximizing isolated development objectives. Instead, sustainable spatial outcomes arise through maintaining equilibrium among interconnected economic, environmental, institutional, ethical, and social dimensions. This repositioning of development from accumulation toward systemic balance represents the manuscript's most important theoretical contribution.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Reviewer's Comment / Report

The paper titled “*Spatial Umran Theory: Toward a Theory of Umranic Equilibrium for Spatial Development and Regional Planning.*” develops Spatial Umran Theory (SUT), drawing on Ibn Khaldun’s concept of Umran to propose an integrative framework for spatial development and regional planning. It introduces “Umranic Equilibrium” as a dynamic balance among economic efficiency, spatial justice, environmental stewardship, social cohesion, and ethical governance. Critiquing fragmented modern paradigms, it offers foundational assumptions, propositions, and a process model explaining territorial flourishing versus decline. While conceptually rich and bridging Islamic thought with contemporary planning, the work remains abstract without empirical validation. Valuable for advancing holistic spatial theory.

Suggestions for Improvement:

1. Strengthen justification using recent spatial planning literature. State explicit theoretical gaps earlier in introduction.
2. Explain limitations of existing paradigms using comparative evidence. Clarify intended audience and practical beneficiaries of theory.
3. Include more contemporary theoretical comparison studies. Distinguish historical interpretation from theoretical innovation.
4. Explain conceptual translation from philosophical principles to spatial mechanisms.
5. Clarify relationships among foundational dimensions explicitly. Strengthen justification for equilibrium-based assumptions.
6. Explain why equilibrium provides superior explanatory capability. Introduce conceptual boundary conditions before formal propositions.
7. Define causal mechanisms more systematically. Clarify dynamic interactions across dimensions.
8. Demonstrate equilibrium shifts through practical spatial examples.
9. Introduce feedback loops and temporal transition mechanisms.
10. Provide empirical scenarios supporting proposition interactions.
11. Develop explicit causal diagrams linking theoretical statements.
12. Recommend mixed-method approaches for comprehensive validation.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

This manuscript presents an original and intellectually ambitious contribution to spatial development scholarship by introducing Spatial Umrans Theory and the concept of Umrans Equilibrium. The integrative framework is conceptually rich and offers substantial interdisciplinary potential. Nevertheless, publication readiness requires minor revision, particularly regarding empirical validation pathways, theory-building transparency, operational measurement procedures, and clearer justification of causal relationships and boundary conditions. Addressing the identified weaknesses will make it suitable for publication in IJAR.

I recommend this paper for publication after minor revision.