



REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-57973

Title: comparative study of ventilator-associated pneumonia and community-acquired pneumonia in icu patients at a tertiary care hospital.

Recommendation:

Accept after major revision

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality			✓	
Techn. Quality			✓	
Clarity		✓		
Significance		✓		

Reviewer's ID: JPR- 198

Detailed Reviewer's Report

This manuscript addresses an important ICU topic by comparing ventilator-associated pneumonia (VAP) and community-acquired pneumonia (CAP). The study highlights differences in microbial profile, antimicrobial resistance, ICU stay, and mortality, which are clinically relevant. However, the study has several methodological and reporting weaknesses that limit its scientific value.

The sample size is small (30 patients per group), reducing statistical power and generalizability. The study is described as cross-sectional, yet outcomes such as ICU stay and mortality suggest a prospective observational design; this should be clarified. Diagnostic criteria for VAP and CAP are not adequately described, raising concerns about case classification. No sample size calculation is provided.

The microbiological findings are generally consistent with ICU literature, showing predominance of Gram-negative organisms and higher antimicrobial resistance in VAP. However, statistical comparisons for pathogen distribution and susceptibility patterns are lacking. Some tables contain formatting errors and inconsistencies (e.g., percentages for *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* and antimicrobial susceptibility tables), making interpretation difficult.

The discussion is brief and largely descriptive. It should compare findings more critically with previous studies and discuss reasons for the observed mortality and resistance patterns. Multivariate analysis to identify independent predictors of mortality would strengthen the manuscript.

Despite these limitations, the study provides useful local antibiogram data and reinforces the burden of MDR pathogens in VAP.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT