



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-57973

Title: Comparative Study of Ventilator-Associated Pneumonia and Community-Acquired Pneumonia in ICU Patients at a Tertiary Care Hospital

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
- ✓ Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strength of the study:

- The study addresses an important clinical problem commonly encountered in intensive care units
- Comparison between VAP and CAP provides useful practical information for clinicians
- Microbiological profile and antibiotic susceptibility patterns were evaluated
- Clinical outcomes including ICU stay and mortality were assessed
- Results are clearly presented using tables and statistical analysis
- Findings highlight the burden of multidrug resistant organisms in ICU settings
- The study has relevance for infection control and antibiotic stewardship programs

Weakness of the study:

- Sample size is relatively small which may affect generalizability
- Single center design limits wider applicability of findings
- Ethical clearance details are not clearly mentioned in the manuscript
- Some grammatical and formatting errors are present
- Discussion section could be expanded with deeper comparison to previous studies
- Potential confounding factors were not fully addressed
- Limited information on prior antibiotic exposure and severity assessment

Reviewers Comments:

The manuscript presents a relevant comparison between ventilator-associated pneumonia and community-acquired pneumonia among ICU patients. The topic is clinically important because antimicrobial resistance and pneumonia-related mortality remain major concerns in critical care settings. The study design is straightforward, and the results demonstrate meaningful differences in microbial profile, antibiotic resistance, ICU stay, and mortality between the two groups. The findings may help guide infection control measures and empirical antibiotic selection. However, the manuscript requires improvement in language, grammar, and overall presentation, as several sentences need editing for clarity and consistency. Ethical clearance and informed consent details should be clearly stated in the methodology section. The study is also limited by its single-center nature and relatively small sample size, which may restrict the generalizability of the findings. Despite these limitations, the work provides useful clinical information and contributes to the understanding of pneumonia patterns in ICU settings. The manuscript can be considered for publication after appropriate revisions.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Previously Published anywhere/Plagiarism check:

The manuscript appears to contain original clinical research and there is no obvious indication that the work has been published elsewhere. No major concerns regarding duplication were identified during review. However, the journal should conduct a formal plagiarism and similarity assessment to confirm originality and ensure compliance with publication ethics before final acceptance.