



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-57952

Title: Sudden Unexpected Cardiac Death in the Emergency Department: Navigating the Medico-Legal Dilemma of Death Certification and Autopsy Waiver under the Bharatiya Nagarik Suraksha Sanhita, 2023

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
- ✓ Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strength of the study:

- Addresses a highly relevant medico legal issue faced by emergency physicians
- Discusses recent legal provisions under the Bharatiya Nagarik Suraksha Sanhita, 2023
- The case scenario is realistic and clinically important
- Integrates medical management with legal and ethical considerations
- Highlights challenges in death certification and autopsy decisions
- References relevant statutory and forensic guidelines
- Provides practical guidance for clinicians handling similar situations

Weakness of the study:

- Based on a single case scenario with limited clinical detail
- The article is largely descriptive and lacks deeper analytical discussion
- Ethical approval or ethical considerations are not clearly mentioned
- Some legal interpretations would benefit from stronger supporting references
- Several references are from non-peer reviewed online sources
- Minor grammatical and formatting inconsistencies are present
- The discussion could include alternative viewpoints and practical challenges

Reviewers Comments:

This manuscript addresses an important and often overlooked medico legal challenge encountered in emergency medicine. The case is presented clearly and effectively demonstrates the difficulties faced by physicians when dealing with sudden unexpected deaths without prior medical documentation. The integration of clinical management, legal obligations, and ethical considerations under the Bharatiya Nagarik Suraksha Sanhita, 2023, is a notable strength of the paper. The discussion is informative and provides practical guidance for clinicians navigating death certification and autopsy related decisions. The manuscript is generally well organized and easy to follow. However, some sections are descriptive and would benefit from deeper critical analysis of legal and ethical implications. Ethical considerations should be stated more explicitly, even though the article is primarily a case-based discussion. Minor grammatical and language issues should be corrected to improve readability. The main limitation is the reliance on a single case scenario, which restricts broader applicability. Overall, the manuscript offers useful educational value and contributes meaningfully to medico legal awareness among healthcare professionals.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Previously Published anywhere/Plagiarism check:

There is no indication that this manuscript has been published previously. The article appears to be an original case-based medico legal discussion supported by relevant references and statutory provisions. No obvious signs of plagiarism were identified during review. Nevertheless, a formal plagiarism and similarity check should be conducted before publication to confirm originality and ensure adherence to publication ethics standards.