



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-57845

Title: Congenital Lobar Emphysema Mimicking Pneumothorax in a 6-Month-Old Infant With Acute Respiratory Distress: A Case Report

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
- ✓ Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strength of the study:

- The manuscript presents a rare and clinically important pediatric respiratory condition
- The case is described in a clear chronological manner from presentation to follow up
- Diagnostic challenges and differential diagnosis are discussed effectively
- CT findings and surgical management are well explained
- The report highlights an important clinical pitfall that can prevent inappropriate treatment
- The discussion is supported by relevant literature and practical learning points

Weakness of the study:

- As a single case report, the findings have limited generalizability
- Radiological images could be presented with more detailed labeling and explanation
- Some sections of the discussion are slightly repetitive
- Minor grammatical and sentence structure issues are present throughout the manuscript
- Long term follow up data are limited
- The report could include more detail regarding perioperative management and postoperative monitoring

Reviewers Comments:

This manuscript describes an interesting case of congenital lobar emphysema presenting as acute respiratory distress and initially mimicking pneumothorax in a six month old infant. The topic is clinically relevant because misdiagnosis may lead to inappropriate interventions and delay definitive treatment. The case presentation is well organized and clearly outlines the diagnostic process, imaging findings, treatment approach, and postoperative outcome. The discussion provides a useful review of the condition and emphasizes important diagnostic clues that help distinguish congenital lobar emphysema from pneumothorax. Ethical aspects are addressed through statements regarding informed consent and publication requirements, which is appropriate for a case report. The overall writing quality is good, although minor grammar corrections and language polishing would improve readability. The main limitation is that conclusions are based on a single patient experience, limiting broader applicability. Additional long term follow up information would strengthen the report. Overall, this is a valuable educational case report that offers practical lessons for pediatricians, radiologists, surgeons, and emergency physicians.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Previously Published anywhere/Plagiarism check:

There is no indication that this case report has been published previously elsewhere. The manuscript appears to be an original presentation of a clinical case supported by relevant literature. The content is appropriately referenced and structured. A routine plagiarism screening is recommended before publication to verify originality and ensure that textual similarity remains within acceptable limits.