



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-57699

Title: META ANALYSIS OF WATER FOOTPRINT OF MAJOR MATERIAL FLOW IN URBAN AREAS

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
- Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision**
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality			x	
Techn. Quality			x	
Clarity		x		
Significance			x	

Reviewer's ID: JPR-171

Detailed Reviewer's Report

This manuscript compiles water footprint data for various commodities (crops, animal products, energy, textiles, construction materials) with an emphasis on Indian cities. While the topic is important, the paper requires major revisions. First, the work is presented as a “meta-analysis” but lacks systematic search strategy, inclusion/exclusion criteria, quality assessment of source studies, and quantitative synthesis (e.g., pooled effect sizes, heterogeneity statistics). It is better described as a narrative literature review with data compilation. Second, the manuscript is poorly organized: repeated chapter headings (e.g., “CHAPTER-1: INTRODUCTION” appears twice), incomplete tables (Table 3 spans 10 pages with formatting errors), and many figures are missing or poorly referenced. Third, the research objectives are vague; the paper does not clearly test specific hypotheses or provide actionable city-level planning tools. Fourth, the “result” chapter presents multiple comparisons (t-tests, Mann-Whitney) but lacks justification for chosen tests and does not address multiple testing or effect sizes. Fifth, the discussion does not synthesize findings into a coherent framework for urban water footprint assessment. The authors must restructure the paper, clarify the methodology (systematic review vs. meta-analysis), complete all tables/figures, and focus on deriving practical recommendations for Indian cities. A major revision is required.