

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-57621

Title: PREMATURE WITHDRAWAL FROM PHILIPPINE NATIONAL POLICE (PNP) SERVICE: PHENOMENOLOGICAL ANALYSIS ON THE COMPELLING FORCES FOR A STRATEGIC ACTION PLAN,

**Recommendation:
Accept after major Revision**

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓,		
Techn. Quality		✓,		
Clarity	✓,			
Significance	✓,			

Reviewer Name: Abdul Haseeb Mir

Detailed Reviewer's Report

The manuscript entitled "**Premature Withdrawal from Philippine National Police (PNP) Service: Phenomenological Analysis on the Compelling Forces for a Strategic Action Plan**" presents a qualitative, phenomenological inquiry into the underlying factors driving Police Non-Commissioned Officers (PNCOs) to exit the service prior to reaching regular retirement age. Utilizing a purposive sample of ten former PNP personnel and applying Colaizzi's rigorous seven-step phenomenological method, the study successfully maps out eighteen distinct themes organized across four core institutional and personal dimensions. The ultimate objective of the paper is to translate these lived experiences into an organizational strategic action plan aimed at reducing rapid turnover, improving officer morale, and stabilizing frontline public service delivery.

The manuscript addresses a highly critical and under-researched operational challenge within public safety administration in the Philippines. Frontline law enforcement personnel represent the backbone of security infrastructure, and understanding why mid-career officers voluntarily resign is crucial for institutional sustainability. The choice of a qualitative phenomenological design is highly appropriate, as it captures localized, nuanced organizational realities that standard quantitative exit surveys often obscure. Furthermore, the systematic deployment of Colaizzi's method demonstrates a strong foundational understanding of qualitative research data analysis.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

However, the manuscript currently exhibits structural redundancies, lacks deep theoretical integration within the discussion, and requires a clearer delineation of the proposed strategic action plan to meet the benchmark for international publication.

Suggestions for Improvement

- **Streamline the Structural Organization and Remove Redundancies:** The manuscript features a significant amount of structural repetition between the results narrative, the comprehensive data tables, and the subsequent discussion section. The author should consolidate these sections by ensuring that the text does not merely repeat the verbatim quotes or thematic labels already clearly outlined in the tables, thereby allowing more room for analytical interpretation.
- **Deepen Theoretical Grounding in the Discussion:** While the findings offer rich descriptive data regarding burnout, familial strain, and administrative challenges, the discussion treats these observations in isolation. The paper would be significantly strengthened by integrating established organizational sociology and occupational psychology frameworks, such as the Job Demands-Resources (JD-R) model or Person-Organization Fit (P-O fit) theory, to explain how structural institutional pressures break down individual retention.
- **Elaborate on the Details of the Strategic Action Plan:** The title and abstract promise a "Strategic Action Plan" designed to counter premature withdrawal. However, the actual concrete steps of this plan remain underdeveloped at the end of the paper. The author should expand this section into a standalone, detailed framework or tabular matrix that explicitly links each major theme (e.g., inadequate compensation, high operational stress) to a specific, actionable institutional countermeasure within the PNP administration.
- **Expand on the Demographics and Gender Nuances:** The methodology notes that the majority of the ten participants were female and married. Given that policing is historically a male-dominated profession, the high concentration of female resignations in this sample represents an important sociological finding. The author should dedicate a specific subsection in the discussion to explore whether female PNCOs face unique gendered hurdles, such as distinct work-family conflicts or lack of gender-sensitive support systems within the frontline PNP ranks.
- **Clarify the Scope of Participant Selection Criteria:** The paper employs purposive sampling to identify former personnel with 4 to 9 years of service experience. The author must explicitly justify why this specific mid-career range was targeted. Additionally, provide a brief statement regarding how long ago these individuals resigned to account for potential recall bias during the in-depth interview process.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- **Address Sampling Limitations and Contextual Scope:** Because the study relies on a tight cohort of ten participants, the author must explicitly state the geographical and institutional boundaries of the sample (e.g., whether participants were drawn from a single regional command, district, or urban center). This localization is necessary to help future researchers understand the contextual boundaries of the findings.
- **Refine and Standardize Academic Formatting:** The document contains several minor technical lapses in formatting. The author must ensure strict compliance with APA 7th edition guidelines for all headings, subheadings, and block quotes. In-text citations should be carefully double-checked against the final reference list to eliminate any missing or incorrectly formatted entries.
- **Correct Minor Typographical and Spacing Errors:** The manuscript contains occasional proofreading oversights, such as missing spaces before parentheses, inconsistent capitalization of thematic headings across sections, and minor punctuation errors within participant quotes. A focused grammatical polish will easily remedy these issues.

Final Recommendation

Recommendation: Revisions Required (Major Revision)

The manuscript explores a compelling, highly relevant, and pragmatically vital topic within contemporary public administration and law enforcement studies in the Philippines. The qualitative methodology is fundamentally sound, and the thematic insights gathered from the participants are valuable. However, to achieve a publishable standard, the manuscript requires a major revision that addresses structural redundancies, deepens the theoretical analysis of the findings, expands upon the unique gender dynamics present in the sample, and presents a fully articulated, actionable Strategic Action Plan.