

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-57610

Title: Ayurvedic Management of Chronic Kidney Disease (*VrikkaVikara*) with Reference to *MutravahSrotodushti*: A Case Study.

Recommendation:

Accept after major revision

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality			✓	
Techn. Quality				✓
Clarity			✓	
Significance			✓	

Reviewer's ID: JPR-198

Detailed Reviewer's Report

This case report describes a 34-year-old male with CKD (creatinine 4.11 mg/dL) treated with Ayurvedic formulations, diet, and lifestyle modifications over ~2 months, showing improved creatinine (1.95 mg/dL) and symptom relief. The topic is clinically relevant, but the manuscript has serious methodological and reporting flaws.

Major Comments

1. No mention of institutional ethics committee approval or registration number. This is mandatory for case reports involving human subjects.
2. **Missing informed consent documentation** – States "informed consent was obtained" but no written confirmation or patient anonymity statement.
3. **Concomitant allopathic medication not accounted for** – Patient was on amlodipine OD. Did the patient continue amlodipine during Ayurvedic treatment? No mention of dosage adjustments or potential interaction. This confounds attribution of improvement.
4. **Unclear timeline** – Table 6 shows dates (10/8/24, 9/9/24, 8/10/24, 7/11/24) but treatment initiation date is 3/9/24. First post-treatment creatinine (3.05 on 9/9/24) is only 6 days after

REVIEWER'S REPORT

starting treatment – too short for meaningful renal function change. Suggests possible lab variability or other factors.

5. **Overly complex and unverifiable dietary protocol** – The "living water" with copper/silver vessels, Rudraksha, Moringa seed powder, and three-tier clay pot filtration is described in excessive detail but lacks any scientific rationale or standardization. This is not reproducible.
6. **No objective measure of adherence** – Patient self-reported compliance? No pill counts, food diaries, or objective verification.
7. **No differential diagnosis** – CKD etiology (hypertensive? diabetic? glomerulonephritis?) not specified. Baseline GFR, urine protein, renal ultrasound, or biopsy not provided.

Minor Comments

- **Abstract** – Claims "creatinine reduced from 4.11 to 1.95" but timeline unclear. Also states "blood urea stabilized from 81.6 to 51.6" – 51.6 is still elevated.
- **Samprapti table** – Lengthy and theoretical; relevance to case management not clearly linked.
- **Figure 1** – it's a image of a standard book, which is firstly not readable and secondly it should be properly cited. Authors are suggested to follow universal standard citing protocol.
- **Medication ingredients** – Table 4 lists many formulations with multiple ingredients (e.g., Renal Care Powder has 7+ ingredients). No quality control or batch information provided.
- **Language** – Some phrases are awkward or repetitive (e.g., "the patient showed significant clinical improvement following Ayurvedic intervention" appears twice).