



REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-57595

Title: Occlusal Curvature Meets Facial Form: Insights from Mathura

Recommendation:

Accept after major revision

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality			✓	
Techn. Quality				✓
Clarity			✓	
Significance			✓	

Reviewer's ID: JPR-198

Detailed Reviewer's Report

This cross-sectional study evaluates the curve of Spee in 160 subjects (80 M, 80 F) from Mathura, India, and its correlation with dentofacial parameters. The topic is relevant to orthodontics, but the manuscript has substantial methodological and presentation issues.

Major Comments

- Unclear primary objective** – Title suggests "facial form" insights, but results show minimal correlation ($R^2=0.071$). The study is largely descriptive with weak predictive findings.
- Missing inclusion criteria justification** – "Average growers as per FMA ($21^\circ-29^\circ$) and gonial angle ($130^\circ \pm 7^\circ$)" – no reference or rationale provided for these cutoffs.
- Statistical errors** – Table 3a shows correlation coefficients as low as 0.485 for COS Max. Lt., yet called "acceptable reproducibility." This is poor reliability for a key measurement.
- Overinterpretation of non-significant findings** – Abstract states "no sexual dimorphism observed" ($p=0.472$) – acceptable, but discussion overstates this as a firm conclusion despite modest sample size.
- Poor table formatting** – Tables 2, 3, 3a-3c are fragmented across pages with missing column headers and alignment issues. Table 16 (regression) is incomplete with missing coefficients.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

6. **Figures and graphs unclear** – Graph 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 lack proper labels, units, or captions. Graph 5 title says "Occlusal plane and their correlation" but shows bars without correlation values.

Minor Comments

- **Abstract wording** – "Aim & Objectives" section is bulleted but should be prose.
- **Introduction too long** – Nearly 2 pages; could be condensed by 40%.
- **Key words** – "APDI Angle, ODI angle" – "angle" is redundant. Also missing "curve of Spee" from keywords? It is present but check consistency.
- **Ethics statement** – Mentioned only as "ethical clearance and consent taken" – no IRB approval number or committee name.