



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 57595

Title: Occlusal Curvature Meets Facial Form: Insights from Mathura

Recommendation:

Accept as it is

Accept after minor revision.....

• **Accept after major revisionYes...**

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	•			
Techn. Quality	•			
Clarity		•		
Significance		•		

Reviewer's ID: JPR-Dr. Sireesha Kuruganti

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Manuscript Title:

“Occlusal Curvature Meets Facial Form: Insights from Mathura”

OVERALL RECOMMENDATION:

Major Revision Required

The manuscript addresses an important orthodontic topic by evaluating the relationship between the curve of Spee and dentofacial morphology in the Mathura population. The topic is clinically relevant and useful for orthodontic diagnosis and treatment planning. However, the manuscript requires substantial revision in terms of scientific writing, methodological clarity, statistical reporting, organization, grammar, formatting consistency, and interpretation of results.

1. TITLE REVIEW

Line 1:

The title is engaging but somewhat informal for a scientific manuscript.

Suggested Revision:

“Relationship Between Curve of Spee and Dentofacial Morphology in the Mathura Population”

2. ABSTRACT REVIEW (Lines 2–19)

Strengths:

- Includes background, methodology, results, and conclusion.
- Sample size is clearly reported.

Major Concerns:

- Statistical values are incomplete.
- p-values and confidence intervals are missing.
- Methodology lacks sampling details.
- Regression analysis is inadequately explained.

Suggested Improvements:

- Include correlation coefficients and exact p-values.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- Clearly separate aim, methods, results, and conclusion.
- Improve sentence structure and readability.

3. INTRODUCTION REVIEW (Lines 21–64)

Strengths:

- Good historical background.
- Clinical relevance is explained.

Major Concerns:

- Introduction is lengthy and repetitive.
- Research gap is not clearly established.
- Recent literature is insufficient.

Specific Comments:

Lines 22–26:

Historical explanation of Von Spee should be condensed.

Lines 30–36:

Add recent references from the last 5 years regarding:

- Deep bite correction
- Digital orthodontics
- CBCT analysis

Lines 56–64:

The rationale for selecting the Mathura population is weak and requires justification.

4. MATERIALS AND METHODS REVIEW (Lines 65–110)

Strengths:

- Inclusion and exclusion criteria are described.
- Equal gender distribution is appreciable.

Major Concerns:

- Ethical approval number missing.
- No sample size calculation.
- Reliability testing absent.
- Statistical software not mentioned.

Specific Comments:

Lines 92–99:

Sample size justification is inadequate.

Recommendation:

Include:

- Effect size
- Statistical power
- Confidence interval

- Sample size calculation formula

Lines 108–109:

Sentence structure should be revised for clarity.

Suggested Revision:

“Before obtaining impressions and lateral cephalograms, demographic details including age and sex were recorded. Ethical clearance and informed consent were obtained from all participants.”

5. METHODOLOGICAL DEFICIENCIES

The manuscript does not report:

- Randomization

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- Blinding
- Intra-examiner reliability
- Inter-examiner reliability
- Method error analysis
- ICC values
- Dahlberg's error analysis

Recommendation:

Authors should include reproducibility and repeatability testing.

6. STATISTICAL ANALYSIS REVIEW

Major Issues:

- Type of correlation test not specified.
- Regression model inadequately described.
- Exact p-values absent.
- Confidence intervals not reported.

Recommendation:

Clearly mention:

- Pearson/Spearman correlation
- Statistical significance threshold
- Regression coefficients
- Effect size

7. RESULTS REVIEW

Major Concerns:

- Tables lack proper formatting.
- Graphs are inadequately labeled.
- Statistical interpretation is incomplete.
- Results and discussion are mixed.

Recommendation:

Use proper reporting format such as:

“A significant negative correlation was observed between FMA and curve of Spee ($r = -0.42$, $p = 0.003$).”

8. DISCUSSION REVIEW

Major Concerns:

- Discussion is descriptive rather than analytical.
- Biological mechanisms are not adequately explained.
- Recent literature is lacking.
- Clinical implications are insufficiently discussed.

Recommendation:

Discuss:

- Orthodontic treatment planning
- Deep bite correction
- Stability after leveling
- Arch length implications

9. CONCLUSION REVIEW

Strengths:

- Concise and clinically oriented.

Concerns:

- Conclusions are broader than supported by data.
- Limitations are not discussed.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- Generalizability is questionable.

Recommendation:

Add:

- Study limitations
- Future research directions
- Need for multicentric studies

10. LANGUAGE AND GRAMMAR REVIEW

Problems Identified:

- Spacing inconsistencies
- Typographical errors
- Capitalization inconsistency
- Awkward sentence construction

Examples:

- "1.89 mm.Significant"
- "population.To assess"
- "beaverage growers"

Recommendation:

Complete professional language editing is required.

11. FORMATTING REVIEW

Major Issues:

- Reference style inconsistency
- Improper figure/table formatting
- Units and symbols inconsistently represented

Recommendation:

Follow journal formatting guidelines strictly.

12. SCIENTIFIC MERIT

Positive Aspects:

- Clinically relevant topic
- Adequate sample size
- Regional orthodontic data contribution

Major Weaknesses:

- Incomplete methodology
- Weak statistical reporting
- Limited analytical discussion
- Absence of reliability testing
- Poor language quality

FINAL RECOMMENDATION:

Major Revision

The manuscript has potential clinical value but requires substantial revision before publication. Authors should improve methodology reporting, statistical analysis, language quality, and discussion depth before reconsideration.