



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

# International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: **IJAR-57290**

**Title:** Return: A Manifesto for Placial Humanities.

**Recommendation:**

Accept after minor revision.....

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity	✓			
Significance		✓		

Reviewer Name: Faheem Abdul

### Reviewer's Comment

This manuscript presents a conceptual and interdisciplinary exploration of the contemporary crisis of the humanities and proposes the paradigm of “Placial Humanities” as a response. The paper engages with themes such as identity, alienation, environmental crisis, and the over-theorization of knowledge, arguing for a renewed grounding of human experience in place-based understanding.

The topic is intellectually ambitious and timely, particularly in light of ongoing debates on the relevance of the humanities in an increasingly technocratic and globalized world. The manuscript contributes by attempting to synthesize insights from spatial theory, ecocriticism, and cultural studies into a unified conceptual framework.

### Scientific Contribution and Analytical Depth

The manuscript demonstrates strong conceptual engagement with major intellectual traditions and thinkers. The discussion of crises in human condition—such as alienation, identity fragmentation, and disconnection from nature—is well articulated (pp. 4–7). The critique of postmodern skepticism and

## **REVIEWER'S REPORT**

over-theorization is particularly relevant and offers a reflective intervention in contemporary humanities discourse.

The proposal of "Placial Humanities" as a framework integrating spatiality and ecological consciousness is a noteworthy contribution. The sections elaborating place as a repository of culture, indigenous knowledge systems, and the role of place in identity formation provide valuable insights (pp. 14–17).

However, the analytical depth can be further strengthened. While the manuscript raises several important arguments, many sections remain broad and philosophical without sufficient critical interrogation or engagement with counter-arguments. The concept of "Placial Humanities," although promising, would benefit from sharper conceptual definition and clearer differentiation from existing frameworks such as ecocriticism or spatial humanities.

### **Methodology and Conceptual Approach**

The manuscript is primarily theoretical and interpretive, drawing on a wide range of secondary sources. This approach is appropriate for a conceptual paper.

Nevertheless, the methodological positioning is not explicitly stated. The paper would benefit from clarifying whether it is intended as a philosophical essay, a theoretical framework, or a manifesto-style intervention. Additionally, the criteria for selecting key theorists and texts could be more clearly articulated to strengthen the coherence of the argument.

### **Structure, Style, and Presentation**

The manuscript follows a logical structure, beginning with the crisis of the human condition, moving through the crisis in humanities, and culminating in the proposal of Placial Humanities. This progression is coherent and supports the central argument.

However, there are areas that require refinement. Some sections are overly dense and contain long, complex sentences that may affect readability. There is occasional repetition of key ideas, particularly regarding crisis and alienation. Streamlining these sections would improve clarity and flow.

The writing style is generally academic, though at times it shifts toward a rhetorical or manifesto-like tone. While this aligns with the intent of the paper, maintaining a more consistent scholarly tone would enhance its suitability for publication.

# International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

*www.journalijar.com*

---

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

### Title Evaluation and Suggestion

The current title is engaging but somewhat vague in academic terms. A slightly more precise formulation could improve clarity and indexing. A suggested revision is:

**“Placial Humanities: Regrounding Human Identity and Knowledge in an Age of Crisis”**

This version retains the original intent while more clearly indicating the analytical focus of the paper.

### Specific Observations

The distinction between ideological and organic identities is conceptually interesting and could be further developed with supporting literature.

The discussion of place as experiential and embodied is a strong element of the paper and aligns well with existing phenomenological traditions.

Some claims—particularly regarding global crises and the failure of current paradigms—would benefit from more precise referencing or empirical grounding.

### Final Recommendation

Overall, the manuscript presents an original and thought-provoking conceptual contribution to contemporary debates in the humanities. Its interdisciplinary scope and normative ambition are commendable.

With minor revisions focusing on sharpening conceptual clarity, refining structure and language, and strengthening theoretical positioning, the manuscript is suitable for publication.

**Decision: Accepted with minor revisions.**