



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

# International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

**Manuscript No.: IJAR-57285**

**Title: Freshwater fish diversity in and around Vadodara district: A focus on small indigenous species**

**Recommendation:**

- Accept as it is .....
- Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision .....**
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*) .....

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		x		
Techn. Quality		x		
Clarity			x	
Significance		x		

**Reviewer's ID: JPR-171**

### *Detailed Reviewer's Report*

This study documents 31 freshwater fish species from the Vadodara region, providing useful baseline data on ichthyofaunal diversity and highlighting the importance of small indigenous species. However, several substantive issues require major revision. First, the methodology lacks critical details: sampling sites are not specified (number, location, characteristics), sampling effort and frequency are not described, and no standardized protocols for abundance assessment are provided (“+”, “++”, “+++” are subjective). Second, taxonomic accuracy is questionable: *Vimba vimba* is a European species not native to Indian freshwaters, suggesting misidentification. *Alburnus alburnus* also has a Eurasian distribution and likely does not occur in Gujarat. These errors undermine confidence in the species list. Third, the presentation of tables and figures is incomplete: Table 1 is fragmented, Table 2 is missing, and figures are not embedded. Fourth, the claim of “first consolidated account” needs qualification given prior studies from Gujarat cited by the authors themselves. Fifth, the conservation status of several species (e.g., *Hypophthalmichthys molitrix* as Near Threatened is incorrect for an introduced species) requires careful revision. The discussion on small indigenous fish lacks direct relevance to the recorded species. The authors must re-verify all identifications, provide complete sampling details, correct taxonomic and status errors, and present all tables/figures properly before resubmission.