



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-57075

Title: The Seal of the Prophets\' dealings with non-Muslims: A study of its objectives and testimonies from European scholars

Recommendation:

Accept after major revision

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality			✓	
Clarity		✓		
Significance			✓	

Reviewer's ID: JPR- Dr. Zainuddin, M.Pd.I

Detailed Reviewer's Report

1. Strengths of the Article

This article makes a meaningful contribution to Islamic studies, particularly in the framework of *maqāsid al-sharī'ah* concerning the Prophet's interactions with non-Muslims. Its main strengths include:

- The topic is highly relevant in the contemporary global context, especially in addressing Islamophobia and interreligious relations.
- The normative foundation based on the Qur'an, Hadith, and classical scholars is strong and well-articulated.
- The inclusion of testimonies from Western scholars adds value and strengthens the argumentative dimension.
- The systematic structure (general and specific objectives of maqasid) enhances readability and coherence.

2. Weaknesses and Areas for Improvement

Although the manuscript is publishable, several aspects need improvement to meet the standards of a reputable journal:

a. Novelty

- The study remains largely descriptive and normative.
- The author should clearly articulate the **research gap** and the **novel contribution** compared to previous studies.

b. Methodology

- The methodological description is too general (limited to "descriptive analytical").
- It should be strengthened by clarifying:

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- Types of data (primary/secondary)
- Analytical techniques
- Theoretical framework

c. Critical Analysis

- The discussion tends to rely on textual exposition rather than critical analysis.
- The paper would benefit from:
 - Deeper interpretation of maqasid in a contemporary context
 - Engagement with current issues (e.g., pluralism, multiculturalism, interfaith relations)

d. References

- The references are predominantly classical.
- The manuscript should incorporate:
 - Recent scholarly works (preferably within the last 10 years)
 - Articles from reputable international journals

e. Academic Writing Style

- Some sections are overly rhetorical and resemble sermonic (khutbah-style) narration.
- The writing should be adjusted to an academic tone:
 - More analytical and objective
 - Less repetitive normative expressions

f. Structure

- The manuscript does not fully follow the IMRAD structure (Introduction, Methods, Results, and Discussion).
- The *Results and Discussion* section should be more clearly defined and analytically developed.

Specific Suggestions

1. Add a comprehensive **literature review** to position the study.
2. Clearly state the **research gap and novelty**.
3. Strengthen the **analytical component**, not merely descriptive exposition.
4. Contextualize maqasid within contemporary global issues (e.g., human rights, tolerance).
5. Incorporate **recent international journal references**.
6. Ensure consistent citation style (preferably APA Style).