

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 57051

Title: Customer Loyalty Model: The Mediation Role of Satisfaction and Word of Mouth on Operational Excellence and Customer Experience.

Recommendation:

Accept after minor revision.

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	✓			
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity	✓			
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr. Bishwajit Rout

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

(To be published with the manuscript in the journal)

The reviewer is requested to provide a brief comment (3-4 lines) highlighting the significance, strengths, or key insights of the manuscript. This comment will be Displayed in the journal publication alongside with the reviewers name.

1. **Significance:** This research is significant as it contributes to service marketing literature by integrating operational excellence and customer experience with mediating roles of satisfaction and word of mouth. It provides empirical evidence from the fitness industry, a relatively underexplored sector. The findings offer practical insights for enhancing customer retention strategies and advancing understanding of indirect pathways influencing customer loyalty.
2. **Strength:** The key strength lies in the robust use of PLS-SEM with a substantial sample size, enabling reliable mediation analysis. The study incorporates multiple relevant constructs, offering a comprehensive model of customer loyalty. Its practical relevance to the fitness service industry enhances applicability, while the integration of satisfaction and word of mouth strengthens the explanatory power of the model.
3. **Key Insight:** The central insight is that customer loyalty is not directly driven by operational excellence or customer experience but emerges through mediating mechanisms of satisfaction and word of mouth. This highlights the importance of evaluative and social processes in shaping loyalty. Firms must therefore focus on enhancing customer satisfaction and encouraging positive communication rather than relying solely on service quality improvements.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Reviewer's Comment / Report

The paper titled “*Customer Loyalty Model: The Mediation Role of Satisfaction and Word of Mouth on Operational Excellence and Customer Experience*” examines the influence of Operational Excellence and Customer Experience on Customer Loyalty among 396 House of Metamorfit fitness members in Indonesia, with Satisfaction and Word of Mouth (WOM) as mediators. Using PLS-SEM via SmartPLS, results show that Operational Excellence and Customer Experience positively and significantly affect Satisfaction and WOM. However, they have no significant direct effect on Loyalty. Satisfaction and WOM significantly influence Loyalty and fully mediate the relationships. The findings highlight that loyalty forms indirectly through evaluative (satisfaction) and social (WOM) pathways. Practical recommendations focus on enhancing service consistency, experience quality, and positive recommendations in competitive fitness services.

Suggestions for Improvement:

1. Clearly define the research problem instead of embedding within descriptive context.
2. Strengthen research gap articulation by explicitly comparing prior studies and identifying unresolved theoretical and empirical inconsistencies in existing literature.
3. Improve coherence by organizing introduction into subsections such as background, problem statement, research gap, and study objectives systematically.
4. Provide deeper theoretical justification for each hypothesized relationship.
5. Include a conceptual model diagram with clear directional arrows and mediating relationships to enhance clarity and theoretical rigor.
6. Justify purposive sampling technique and address potential sampling bias concerns.
7. Provide more detail on questionnaire design and scale validation procedures.
8. Elaborate on reliability and validity testing procedures including Cronbach's alpha, composite reliability, and AVE thresholds for measurement model evaluation.
9. Avoid repeating table values directly in descriptive discussion sections.
10. Expand interpretation beyond statistical significance to managerial implications.
11. Reduce repetition of findings already discussed in previous sections.
12. Clearly separate conclusion from managerial implications and future research suggestions.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

The study presents a relevant and empirically sound examination of customer loyalty formation using PLS-SEM, offering meaningful insights into mediation effects of satisfaction and word of mouth. While the sample size and methodology are appropriate, theoretical depth and critical analysis require enhancement. With improved conceptual clarity, methodological justification, and stronger academic rigor, the paper holds good potential for publication in IJAR. Addressing the identified weaknesses will make it suitable for publication in IJAR.

I recommend this paper for publication after minor revision.