

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-57036

Title: EFFECTIVENESS OF CERTAIN ESSENTIAL OILS ON SPODOPTERA LITTORALIS (Boisd.)

Recommendation:

Accept as it is

Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality			x	
Techn. Quality		x		
Clarity			x	
Significance			x	

Reviewer's ID: JPR-171

Detailed Reviewer's Report

This manuscript evaluates the larvicidal and antifeedant effects of eucalyptus and clove essential oils against the 4th instar larvae of *Spodoptera littoralis*. The topic is relevant and aligns with current efforts to develop botanical alternatives to synthetic pesticides. However, the manuscript requires major revision before it can be accepted for publication. A critical issue is the presentation of mortality data: in the abstract, the value " $83.83 \pm 73.33\%$ " is statistically impossible because the standard deviation cannot exceed the mean to such an extreme, suggesting a typographical or calculation error that undermines data credibility. Additionally, Table 1 contains numerous formatting inconsistencies (e.g., misplaced superscripts, unclear L.S.D. labeling), and Figure 1 is mentioned but not provided. The antifeeding results are presented adequately, but the discussion is overly long and includes excessive citation lists without critical synthesis. The language requires professional editing for clarity and grammatical correctness. The methodology section lacks detail on replication and controls, and the statistical analysis description is disjointed. Furthermore, the conclusion is too brief and does not fully integrate the findings. The authors must correct numerical errors, reformat all tables according to journal standards, provide missing figures, and streamline the discussion. Given these substantial issues, a major revision is recommended to ensure scientific rigor and presentation quality.