



REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-56947

Title: Ayurvedic Management of Gambhira Vatarakta (Avascular Necrosis of Femoral Head) through Panchakarma: A Case Report

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
- ✓ Accept after minor revision.....**
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strength of the study

- The case is presented clearly with proper clinical history and background
- Good attempt to correlate modern diagnosis with Ayurvedic concepts
- Treatment protocol is described in a stepwise and understandable manner
- Use of objective measures like VAS score and range of motion improves credibility
- MRI confirmation supports the diagnosis
- Relevant topic considering rise of post-COVID AVN cases
- Practical and cost-effective treatment approach is highlighted

weakness of the study

- Only a single case, so findings cannot be generalized
- No comparison or control group
- No post-treatment MRI or long-term follow-up evidence
- Conclusions appear slightly strong for a case report
- Limited outcome measures used
- No mention of adverse effects or safety monitoring
- Some parts are too theoretical and lengthy

Reviews Comments

The manuscript is clinically relevant and interesting, especially in the context of increasing AVN cases. However, ethical clearance is not clearly mentioned and should be added along with a proper statement of informed consent. The language is generally understandable but there are minor grammatical errors, spacing issues, and some very long sentences that need simplification. The discussion section is informative but slightly over-explained and can be made more concise. The authors should also clearly mention limitations of the study and avoid overgeneralization of results. Inclusion of follow-up imaging would strengthen the paper further. Overall, the paper is good but needs polishing.