



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-56663

Title: Field Trial on the Effects of Seedling Age, Yield and Economic Returns of Sahel 134 under Lowland Irrigated Ecology

Recommendation:

Accept as it is

Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality			✓	
Clarity			✓	
Significance		✓		

Reviewer's ID: JPR-002

Detailed Reviewer's Report

The manuscript titled “*Field Trial on the Effects of Seedling Age, Yield and Economic Returns of Sahel 134 under Lowland Irrigated Ecology*” investigates the agronomic performance and economic viability of different seedling ages in rice cultivation under irrigated lowland conditions. The study aims to assess growth parameters, yield outcomes, and profitability associated with the Sahel 134 rice variety using a randomized complete block design and statistical analysis through ANOVA. The research topic is relevant to sustainable agricultural productivity and food security, particularly in regions experiencing soil fertility and water management challenges. The practical orientation of the study enhances its potential value for farmers, agricultural planners, and extension agencies.

From the standpoint of **originality**, the paper contributes to the existing literature by focusing on optimizing seedling age as a determinant of yield and economic return in irrigated rice ecosystems. While similar agronomic trials have been conducted in other geographical contexts, the study provides contextual insights into the performance of Sahel 134 under specific ecological conditions. However, the manuscript would benefit from a clearer articulation of the research gap and stronger engagement with recent empirical and theoretical studies in the introduction and literature review sections. Strengthening the conceptual framing will improve the scholarly contribution of the work.

Regarding **technical quality**, the adoption of a randomized complete block design and the application of descriptive statistics and ANOVA are appropriate for the objectives of the study. The

REVIEWER'S REPORT

presentation of yield indicators such as percentage of ripened grains, paddy yield, and production cost analysis demonstrates methodological rigor. Nevertheless, the paper requires more detailed explanation of sampling procedures, treatment justification, and control measures to enhance replicability. Additionally, the statistical results should be interpreted more critically, with clearer discussion of significance levels, assumptions of the model, and potential limitations affecting generalizability.

In terms of **clarity and presentation**, the manuscript follows a conventional research structure, including abstract, introduction, methodology, results, and conclusion. Key agronomic variables and economic outcomes are discussed in a logical sequence. However, language editing is necessary to improve grammar, sentence construction, and academic tone. Some tables and numerical values require better formatting and explanatory captions for improved readability. The discussion section can also be strengthened by linking empirical findings more explicitly with previous research and practical implications.

With respect to **significance**, the study holds considerable applied importance for improving rice productivity and enhancing farmers' income through better agronomic practices. The identification of optimal seedling age contributing to higher yield and economic returns provides actionable recommendations for stakeholders in irrigated rice production systems. With revisions to strengthen methodological transparency, theoretical grounding, and linguistic clarity, the manuscript has the potential to make a useful contribution to agricultural economics and crop management literature.

Overall Recommendation:

Minor Revision