

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-56579

Title: Therapeutic Impact of Nidan Parivarjan, Ahar, Vihar and Shaman Chikitsa in a Case of Prostatomegaly (Paurush Granthi)

Recommendation:

Accept after minor revision.....

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality			✓	
Techn. Quality			✓	
Clarity		✓		
Significance			✓	

Reviewer's ID: JPR-198

Detailed Reviewer's Report

This is a well-structured case report documenting the Ayurvedic management of a 62-year-old male with prostatomegaly. The clinical narrative is coherent, the treatment rationale is clearly described, and the outcome data is adequately presented. The manuscript is suitable for publication after addressing the minor concerns noted below.

Major Comments

- 1. Discrepancy in Ultrasonographic Data (Critical)** Table 3 is titled "Pre-treatment ultrasonographic data as of August 11, 2025," but August 11, 2025 is actually the post-treatment scan date. The pre-treatment scan was April 14, 2025. This appears to be a labelling error and must be corrected to avoid reader confusion.
- 2. Conclusion Data Inconsistency** In the Conclusion section (lines 307–309), the post-treatment prostate volume is reported as 113.0 cc and post-void residual urine as 253.0 cc, which contradicts Table 6, which correctly states the post-treatment prostate volume as 80 cc and PVR as 113.0 ml. The numbers appear to have been transposed. This must be corrected.
- 3. PSA Follow-up Absent** The pre-treatment PSA was 7.927 ng/ml, which is mildly elevated and clinically significant. No post-treatment PSA value was reported. Given that PSA monitoring is essential in prostatomegaly management, at least a brief explanation for its absence or a follow-up value should be included.

REVIEWER'S REPORT**Minor Comments**

- 4. Figure 2 (Samprapti) Not Visible** The schematic for Samprapti of VrishyaGranthi (Figure 2) is referenced in the text but does not appear in the manuscript body. Please ensure it is properly embedded.
- 5. Abstract Terminology** The abstract mentions "VrishyaGranthi, MutrakrichraandMutraghata" without spacing between terms. This appears to be a formatting/typographic issue that needs cleaning throughout the manuscript — similar spacing errors appear repeatedly in the text (e.g., "NidanParivarjan", "AshtasthanaPareeksha").
- 6. Table 5 Formatting** The dates in Table 5 are listed out of sequence in the rendered version. Please verify the chronological order is correct (16-04-2025 → 19-05-2025 → 21-05-2025 → 31-08-2025).
- 7. Shodhan Chikitsa Mentioned but Not Discussed** Figure 3 (ChikitsaKrama) includes Shodhan Chikitsa (Panchakarma therapies) as a component, but it is never discussed in the treatment plan or results. Authors should either remove it from the figure or briefly clarify whether it was employed or omitted and why.
- 8. Quality of Life Assessment Tool** The authors claim "substantial enhancement in quality of life" but do not use any validated tool (e.g., IPSS – International Prostate Symptom Score) to quantify this. For a case report this is acceptable, but at least acknowledging this as a limitation would strengthen the manuscript.
- 9. Ethics/Consent Statement** No patient consent statement is included. Please add a written informed consent disclosure for case reports.