



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-56531

Title: XERODERMA PIGMENTOSUM ET ADÉNOCARCINOME DE L'ESOPHAGE CHEZ L'ENFANT : À PROPOS D'UN CAS

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
- ✓ **Accept after minor revision.....**
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance			✓	

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strengths of the Study

- The case report addresses a highly rare clinical entity by documenting an unprecedented association between Xeroderma Pigmentosum and esophageal adenocarcinoma in a pediatric patient.
- The manuscript offers a detailed chronological clinical presentation, including diagnostic work-up, histological findings, and imaging results.
- It highlights important considerations about the risk of internal malignancies in patients with DNA repair deficiencies, particularly XP.
- The inclusion of a familial history and genetic counseling emphasizes the relevance of genetic aspects in managing such rare cases.
- The comprehensive literature review contextualizes the rarity and significance of the findings.

Weaknesses of the Study

- The report is limited by its nature as a single case study, which restricts broader generalization.
- There is no information on molecular genetic testing, which would substantiate the hypothesized genetic predisposition.
- The methodology for diagnosing and classifying the tumor follows standard procedures; however, no discussion of treatment options or potential interventions is provided, limiting clinical utility.
- The literature review, although extensive, could be expanded by including recent advances on DNA repair deficiencies and internal cancer risks.
- Figures and images referenced are not attached in the uploaded file, which hampers visualization and understanding.
- The manuscript lacks explicit information on ethical approval or consent for publishing the case.
- Minor language and typographical errors affect readability and should be reviewed.

Reviewer Comments

- **Title and Abstract:** The title accurately reflects the content but could be more concise for clarity. The abstract is well-structured, summarizing objectives, key findings, and significance, but should explicitly mention the novelty of a pediatric XP case with esophageal adenocarcinoma to emphasize its contribution.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- **Introduction and Objectives:** The introduction provides relevant background on XP and esophageal cancers, but it would benefit from a clearer statement of the specific research question or objectives.
- **Methodology and Statistical Analysis:** As a case report, formal statistical analysis is not applicable. However, detailed diagnostic criteria, genetic testing, and pathology methodologies should be included to strengthen validity.
- **Results and Discussion:** Results are sufficiently detailed; however, critical analysis of potential pathogenetic mechanisms linking XP to internal tumors is somewhat superficial. The discussion should explore more on the genetic mutations involved and possible preventive measures.
- **Conclusion and Implications:** The conclusion appropriately emphasizes the rarity and clinical importance but should suggest specific follow-up protocols or management strategies for similar cases.
- **Ethical Clearance:** The manuscript does not specify whether ethical approval or informed consent was obtained, which is essential for publishing patient data, especially in pediatric cases.
- **Language and Formatting:** The manuscript is generally understandable but contains grammatical errors, awkward phrasing, and inconsistencies that need editing. The figures and their legends should be formatted properly, and references should follow a consistent style.
- **References:** References are appropriate; however, cross-verification for accuracy and currentness is recommended. In-text citations should correspond to references properly.