

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

**Manuscript No.: IJAR- 56460**

**Title: "FROM REACTION TO RESULTS": MEASURING THE EFFECTIVENESS OF HALAL TRAINING PROGRAMS USING KIRKPATRICK'S MODEL.**

**Recommendation:**

**Accept after minor revision.**

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	✓			
Techn. Quality			✓	
Clarity		✓		
Significance			✓	

**Reviewer Name: Dr. Bishwajit Rout**

### Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

*(To be published with the manuscript in the journal)*

*The reviewer is requested to provide a brief comment (3-4 lines) highlighting the significance, strengths, or key insights of the manuscript. This comment will be Displayed in the journal publication alongside with the reviewers name.*

1. **Significance:** The study contributes to the growing literature on halal governance by demonstrating the strategic importance of training evaluation within compliance-based industries. By applying Kirkpatrick's evaluation framework to halal training programs, the research highlights the role of human capital development in sustaining institutional credibility, regulatory compliance, and ethical organizational conduct within rapidly expanding global halal markets.
2. **Strength:** The manuscript demonstrates strong conceptual integration between training evaluation theory, governance frameworks, and Islamic management principles. The qualitative case study approach provides rich contextual insights into halal training practices. The structured analysis across the four evaluation levels offers a comprehensive understanding of how training outcomes translate into behavioural change and organisational governance improvements.
3. **Key Insight:** The central insight of this research is that halal training effectiveness extends beyond knowledge acquisition to encompass governance and institutional outcomes. Training programs generate meaningful results only when supported by organizational culture, leadership commitment, and structured governance mechanisms. Consequently, training evaluation should be integrated into broader halal governance frameworks to ensure sustained compliance and organisational accountability.

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

### *Reviewer's Comment / Report*

The paper titled “*FROM REACTION TO RESULTS*”: *MEASURING THE EFFECTIVENESS OF HALAL TRAINING PROGRAMS USING KIRKPATRICK'S MODEL*” qualitative case study evaluates halal training program effectiveness in Perak, Malaysia, using Kirkpatrick's Four-Level Model (reaction, learning, behaviour, results). Based on semi-structured interviews with three certified trainers, document analysis, and observation, it finds strong positive reactions and improved foundational knowledge (especially Halal Assurance System), but behavioural change and organisational results heavily depend on management commitment, organisational culture, and post-training governance. The work usefully applies Kirkpatrick's framework to a values-driven, compliance-focused industry, offering practical implications for halal governance. Limited by small sample and single-region focus, yet a valuable contribution to Islamic management literature.

### **Suggestions for Improvement:**

1. Present the research objectives clearly in a structured and concise format.
2. Strengthen the problem statement by highlighting gaps in halal training evaluation research.
3. Include recent empirical statistics demonstrating the rapid growth of halal industry training initiatives globally.
4. Reduce descriptive summaries and incorporate more critical comparison between previous studies.
5. Include a conceptual diagram illustrating relationships among variables and training evaluation levels.
6. Provide clearer explanation of participant selection criteria and sampling justification.
7. Include detailed demographic information about trainers participating in the interviews.
8. Clearly distinguish theoretical contributions from managerial or policy implications.
9. Elaborate how the study extends existing theories of training effectiveness.
10. Provide specific examples of governance mechanisms supporting halal training implementation.
11. Clarify how regulatory agencies can institutionalize training evaluation practices.
12. Highlight the most important research finding related to governance outcomes.

# International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

*www.journalijar.com*

---

## **REVIEWER'S REPORT**

The manuscript addresses an important and emerging research area by evaluating halal training effectiveness using Kirkpatrick's Four-Level Training Evaluation Model. The integration of training evaluation with halal governance and Islamic management perspectives represents a meaningful contribution. However, improvements are required in literature synthesis, methodological transparency, and analytical depth. With revisions emphasizing conceptual clarity, stronger empirical interpretation, and clearer theoretical positioning, the manuscript has strong potential for publication in IJAR. Addressing the identified weaknesses will make it suitable for publication in IJAR.

I recommend this paper for publication after minor revision.