



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-56416

Title: Occult Primary Breast Carcinoma Presenting as Isolated Cervical Lymphadenopathy: A Comprehensive Multimodal Management Approach

- Recommendation:**
- Accept as it is
 - ✓ **Accept after minor revision.....**
 - Accept after major revision
 - Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strengths of the Study

- **Originality and Rationale:** The manuscript addresses a rare presentation of occult primary breast carcinoma manifesting solely as cervical lymphadenopathy, contributing valuable insights into diagnosis and management of such uncommon cases.
- **Comprehensive Management:** The report provides a detailed, multimodal treatment strategy including surgery, chemotherapy, radiotherapy, endocrine therapy, CDK4/6 inhibition, and bisphosphonate therapy, highlighting an evidence-based approach.
- **Diagnostic Methodology:** Utilization of immunohistochemistry to confirm breast origin of lymph node metastasis demonstrates appropriate, modern diagnostic practices.
- **Follow-up Data:** An 18-month disease-free follow-up supports the short-term efficacy of the outlined management approach.
- **Literature Integration:** The manuscript effectively integrates existing knowledge about occult breast cancer, emphasizing the importance of multidisciplinary treatment.

Weaknesses of the Study

- **Single Case Limitation:** The report is limited to a single patient, which reduces generalizability and precludes statistical analysis.
- **Lack of Long-term Outcomes:** Longer follow-up data are necessary to assess durability of improvements or recurrence rates.
- **Limited Discussion of Differential Diagnosis:** The paper could expand on differential diagnoses considered and excluded, providing a clearer diagnostic pathway.
- **Insufficient Detail on Selection of Treatment Modalities:** The rationale behind choosing particular chemotherapy and targeted therapy protocols over alternatives should be elaborated.
- **Absence of Ethical Approval Details:** The manuscript does not explicitly state whether institutional ethical approval was obtained or if informed consent was secured.
- **Language and Formatting:** Minor grammatical errors and inconsistent referencing formatting diminish overall readability.
- **Limited Visual Aids:** Inclusion of figures such as imaging scans, histopathology images, or treatment timelines would enhance clarity.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Reviewer Comments

- **Title and Abstract Clarity:** The title accurately reflects the focus on occult breast carcinoma presenting as cervical lymphadenopathy and the multimodal management approach. The abstract succinctly summarizes key aspects but could enhance clarity by explicitly stating the study design (case report) and emphasizing the novelty of the presentation.
- **Introduction and Objectives:** The introduction provides sufficient background on occult breast cancer and its rarity; however, it could explicitly state the specific objective of this report—namely, to elucidate the diagnostic process and management of a rare presentation.
- **Methodology and Statistical Analysis:** As a case report, formal statistical analysis is not applicable; methodology is appropriate, involving clinical assessment, imaging, histopathology, and treatment details. Clarification on ethical approval and informed consent procedures should be included.
- **Results and Discussion:** Results are clearly presented with clinical, imaging, and pathological findings. The discussion appropriately contextualizes the rarity and management of such cases but could further analyze the implications of the chosen treatment regimen and compare long-term outcomes with existing literature.
- **Conclusion and Implications:** The conclusion appropriately emphasizes the significance of immunohistochemistry and a multidisciplinary approach. It could be strengthened by suggesting future research directions or advocating for long-term follow-up strategies.
- **Ethical Clearance:** The manuscript mentions informed consent was obtained but does not specify whether institutional review board or ethics committee approval was secured, which is a necessary ethical requirement.
- **Language, Grammar, and Presentation:** The English language is generally clear but requires minor editing to correct typographical and grammatical errors. Consistency in referencing style and straightforward formatting would improve readability.
- **Tables, Figures, Formatting, and References:** Limited visual data are presented; including relevant images such as histopathological slides, imaging scans, and diagrams would greatly enhance comprehension. References are relevant; however, formatting should follow journal standards consistently.