ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

ISSN NO. 2320-5407

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-56316

Title: Ulcerated Syringocystadenoma Papilliferum of the Scalp in an Adult Woman: A Clinical and Dermoscopic Description of a De Novo Case

Recommendation:

Accept as it is .....

Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision .....YES.....

Do not accept (*Reasons below*) .....

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		√		
Techn. Quality			√	
Clarity			√	
Significance			√	

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strengths

Rare Clinical Presentation

The manuscript reports a de novo adult-onset ulcerated case of Syringocystadenoma papilliferum (SCAP), which is uncommon and clinically noteworthy.

Comprehensive Clinicopathological Correlation

The authors clearly describe clinical, dermoscopic, and histopathological findings, correlating them effectively.

Useful Differential Diagnosis Discussion

The comparison with malignant mimickers such as Amelanotic melanoma and non-pigmented Basal cell carcinoma strengthens the diagnostic relevance of the report.

Educational Value for Dermatologists and Pathologists

The manuscript emphasizes the importance of histopathological confirmation in atypical adnexal tumors.

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Well-Illustrated Figures

Clinical, dermoscopic, and histologic descriptions are appropriate and support the diagnosis.

Weaknesses

Major Inconsistency in Follow-up

The Abstract states "no recurrence after six months of follow-up."

The Case Report section states the patient was "lost to follow-up."
This contradiction must be resolved.

Repetition in Discussion

Lines 67–72 are repeated in lines 73–78.
This indicates insufficient editorial revision.

Language and Formatting Issues

Inconsistent spelling of "Syringocystadenomapapilliferum."

Minor grammatical errors.

Spacing issues (e.g., missing spaces in lines).

Formatting inconsistencies in references.

Limited Literature Contextualization

The discussion does not adequately quantify:

How many adult de novo SCAP cases have been reported.

How many ulcerated cases are documented in literature.

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Reference Verification Needed

References dated 2025 should be verified for accuracy and publication status.

Ethical and Consent Statements Missing

No mention of:

Patient consent

Ethical approval (if required by journal policy)

Significance

The case adds to limited literature on adult-onset de novo SCAP.

Highlights dermoscopy as a supportive diagnostic tool.

Reinforces the role of histopathology in differentiating benign adnexal tumors from malignant mimickers.

However, as a single case report without novel molecular or therapeutic insight, the overall scientific impact is moderate.

Key Points for Improvement

Correct the follow-up discrepancy.

Remove duplicated paragraphs in the Discussion.

Improve English language and formatting consistency.

Expand literature comparison with previously reported adult de novo SCAP cases.

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Add patient consent and ethical compliance statements.

Standardize terminology throughout the manuscript.

Ensure reference accuracy and proper citation formatting.

Overall Recommendation

Major Revision

The manuscript presents an interesting and rare case; however, significant revisions are required to address inconsistencies, editorial errors, and to strengthen the literature discussion before it can be considered for publication.

"Ulcerated Syringocystadenoma Papilliferum of the Scalp in an Adult Woman: A Clinical and Dermoscopic Description of a De Novo Case"

JUSTIFICATION FOR MAJOR REVISION

Follow-up Inconsistency (Major Scientific Issue)

Issue Identified:
The Abstract states that there was "no recurrence after six months of follow-up," whereas the Case Report section states that the patient was "lost to follow-up."

Justification:
This represents a direct contradiction within the manuscript. Follow-up data are critical in case reports, particularly for benign adnexal tumors such as Syringocystadenoma papilliferum, where recurrence and rare malignant transformation are clinically relevant. Inconsistent reporting undermines the reliability and credibility of the manuscript.

Required Action:
Clarify the true follow-up status and ensure consistency across Abstract, Case Report, Discussion, and Conclusion sections.

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Duplication in Discussion (Editorial and Structural Concern)

Issue Identified:

Paragraphs in lines 67–72 are repeated in lines 73–78.

Justification:

Redundant content reflects inadequate editorial revision and reduces manuscript quality. It may also suggest insufficient restructuring of the discussion section.

Required Action:

Remove duplicated text and reorganize the Discussion for clarity and logical flow.

Limited Literature Contextualization (Scientific Depth Issue)

Issue Identified:

The manuscript does not quantify:

The number of adult-onset de novo SCAP cases reported.

The number of ulcerated cases documented in literature.

Justification:

A case report must clearly establish novelty. Without comparison to previously reported cases, the claim of rarity remains insufficiently supported. Contextualization is essential to demonstrate the added value of this report.

Required Action:

Expand the Discussion to include:

A brief literature review summarizing previously reported adult de novo cases.

A comparison table (if possible).

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

Clarification of how this case differs from earlier reports.

Reference Verification and Accuracy (Scholarly Integrity Issue)

Issue Identified:

Multiple references dated 2025 are cited.

Justification:

If these references are in press, unpublished, or inaccurately cited, this may affect scientific reliability. Reference accuracy is fundamental for academic transparency.

Required Action:

Verify:

Publication status

DOI validity

Correct citation format

Journal indexing status (if applicable)

Language and Terminology Inconsistencies (Clarity Issue)

Issues Identified:

Inconsistent spelling of "Syringocystadenomapapilliferum."

Minor grammatical errors.

Formatting issues in spacing and references.

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Justification:
Precision in terminology is essential in dermatopathology. Inconsistent spelling of Syringocystadenoma papilliferum reduces professional quality and may affect indexing.

Required Action:

Standardize terminology throughout.

Perform professional English language editing.

Ensure uniform formatting according to journal guidelines.

Ethical and Consent Statements Missing (Ethical Compliance Issue)

Issue Identified:
No statement regarding:

Informed patient consent

Ethical approval (if applicable)

Justification:
Most dermatology journals require explicit confirmation of patient consent for publication of clinical images. Absence of ethical compliance statements may result in immediate rejection.

Required Action:
Add:

A patient consent statement.

Ethical approval declaration (if required by journal policy).

Scientific Contribution and Impact (Overall Assessment)

Issue Identified:
While clinically interesting, the manuscript does not provide:

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Novel diagnostic criteria

Molecular insights

Therapeutic innovation

Justification:
As a single case report, the scientific impact is inherently limited. To justify publication, clarity, accuracy, and strong literature contextualization are essential.

Overall Justification for "Major Revision"

The manuscript addresses a rare presentation of Syringocystadenoma papilliferum and has educational value. However, the following major issues necessitate substantial revision before reconsideration:

Internal contradiction in follow-up reporting

Duplicated discussion content

Insufficient literature contextualization

Need for reference verification

Language and formatting inconsistencies

Missing ethical declarations

These concerns affect scientific clarity, credibility, and compliance with publication standards.

Final Recommendation: Major Revision Required Before Reconsideration