



REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-56312

Title: PICE as a competency-based extension of Authentic Leadership: internal consistency, convergent validity, and developmental utility beyond the ALQ.

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
- Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*).....

| Rating | Excel. | Good | Fair | Poor |
|----------------|--------|------|------|------|
| Originality | | Yes | | |
| Techn. Quality | | Yes | | |
| Clarity | | Yes | | |
| Significance | | Yes | | |

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Review Report – Revision Points

1. **Abstract Conciseness:** Reduce the length of the abstract by removing excessive statistical details and phase-wise procedural descriptions; retain only the purpose, methodology, key results, and major implications in a structured and concise form.
2. **Clarification of Conceptual Contribution:** Strengthen the theoretical positioning of PICE as an extension of Authentic Leadership by more explicitly explaining how it advances beyond the ALQ in terms of competency traceability and developmental application.
3. **Justification of Sample Size:** Provide a clearer rationale for the adequacy of the Phase 3 validation sample (22 companies, 133 participants) and discuss its implications for generalizability and statistical power.
4. **Methodological Transparency:** Elaborate on the sampling technique, sectoral distribution of organizations, cultural/geographical context, and data collection procedure to improve the reproducibility and external validity of the study.
5. **Measurement and Model Structure:** Include a brief explanation of how the 50 competencies were operationalized, developed, and mapped onto the four Authentic Leadership dimensions, preferably supported by a table or appendix.
6. **Cognitive Factor Interpretation:** Provide deeper discussion on the comparatively lower convergence in the cognitive dimension and clarify whether this reflects construct expansion, measurement differences, or contextual leadership behavior variability.
7. **Common Method Bias and Validity Checks:** Indicate whether any statistical controls (e.g., Harman's single-factor test or other procedural remedies) were applied to address potential common method bias in self-follower ratings.
8. **Practical Implications:** Expand the section on managerial and leadership development implications by illustrating how PICE can be used for individualized training pathways, coaching, performance management, or competency-based HR systems.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

9. **Comparison with Existing Models:** Integrate more recent and relevant literature on competency-based leadership frameworks and authentic leadership measurement to position the model within the broader scholarly debate.
10. **Limitations and Future Research:** Provide a more explicit limitations section addressing sample scope, cross-sectional design, reliance on perception-based measures, and the need for longitudinal or cross-cultural validation.
11. **Language and Structure:** Minor editorial revisions are required to improve flow, reduce repetition, and ensure consistency in reporting statistical values and factor names throughout the manuscript.
12. **Visual Presentation:** Consider adding a conceptual framework figure and a comparative table (PICE vs. ALQ) to enhance clarity and reader comprehension.

Overall, the manuscript has strong potential, and addressing the above points will significantly improve its theoretical clarity, methodological rigor, and practical relevance.