



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-56311

Title: POLYGAMY IN THE CONTEXT OF MULTIDISCIPLINARY STUDIES: AN ANALYSIS OF AMINA WADUDS FEMINIST THEORY

Recommendation:

Accept as it is

Accept after minor revision

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	...			
Techn. Quality		...		
Clarity	...			
Significance	...			

Reviewer Name: Dr. Ishrat Fatima

Detailed Reviewer's Report

The article entitled “**Polygamy in the Context of Multidisciplinary Studies: An Analysis of Amina Wadud’s Feminist Theory**” examines the issue of polygamy in Indonesia through legal, sociological, psychological, biological, and economic perspectives while grounding its theological analysis in the feminist hermeneutics of Amina Wadud. The paper situates its argument within the ongoing tension between classical interpretations of Q.S. An-Nisa:3 and modern principles of gender equality embedded in Indonesian Marriage Law No. 16/2019 and international frameworks such as CEDAW. The central thesis argues that polygamy, though textually permitted under certain Qur’anic conditions, functions in contemporary Indonesia as a form of structural discrimination that undermines women’s dignity and family harmony. The study ultimately proposes monogamy as the normative Islamic ideal through a contextual reinterpretation of the verse.

The introduction effectively establishes the legal and socio-religious controversy surrounding polygamy. It explains how Q.S. An-Nisa:3 has traditionally been read as granting conditional permission, while Indonesian law (particularly the Compilation of Islamic Law/KHI) imposes procedural restrictions such as court permission and the first wife’s consent. The paper accurately highlights the contradiction between these legal allowances and international human rights commitments. However, while the problem statement is clear, the introduction occasionally overstates its claims for instance, asserting that polygamy “must be replaced” by monogamy before the analytical sections fully substantiate this conclusion. A more neutral framing at the outset would strengthen the academic objectivity of the paper. The literature review demonstrates engagement with recent scholarship on polygamy and feminist Qur’anic interpretation. It references contemporary Indonesian studies as well as works focusing specifically on Amina Wadud’s methodology. The review successfully shows the research gap: while previous studies discuss either multidisciplinary interpretations or Wadud’s hermeneutics separately, this paper attempts to synthesize both. This claim of novelty is plausible. However, the literature review would benefit from deeper comparative analysis rather than summarizing prior works. For example, it mentions scholars like Buya Hamka and Quraish Shihab but does not critically compare their hermeneutical frameworks with Wadud’s approach in detail.

Methodologically, the study adopts a library research model, relying on primary texts such as Qur’an and Woman and A Jihad for Justice by Amina Wadud. This method is appropriate for a theoretical and interpretative inquiry. The paper clearly distinguishes between primary and secondary sources and explains its contextual-historical analytical approach. Nevertheless, the methodology section remains descriptive rather than analytical. It does not clearly outline specific analytical steps, criteria for source selection, or how multidisciplinary insights are systematically integrated. A more structured explanation of analytical procedures would enhance methodological rigor. The biographical section on Amina Wadud provides relevant intellectual background, including her conversion

REVIEWER'S REPORT

to Islam, academic career, and the reception of her work. This contextualization helps readers understand the intellectual motivations behind her feminist hermeneutics. However, some biographical details, such as the banning of her book in the UAE, are mentioned without citation support within the body text, which slightly weakens academic precision. The section could also better connect her biography to her methodological innovations rather than presenting life details separately.

The core analytical strength of the paper lies in its explanation of Wadud's hermeneutical method. It accurately describes her three-fold interpretative framework: attention to historical context, grammatical analysis, and holistic Qur'anic principles. The discussion of her adaptation of Fazlur Rahman's double movement theory is conceptually correct, emphasizing the movement from historical context to contemporary moral application. The paper convincingly explains Wadud's argument that justice ('adl) in polygamy is practically unattainable, especially when read alongside Q.S. An-Nisa:129. This intertextual reading supports the claim that the Qur'an implicitly discourages polygamy. The explanation of tawhid as ethical equality and maqasid al-shariah as prioritizing justice and human welfare reflects a reasonably accurate interpretation of Wadud's thought.

The multidisciplinary section attempts to strengthen the argument by incorporating biological, social, and psychological dimensions. The critique of biological determinism that women's reproductive capacity does not reduce them to motherhood is consistent with Wadud's perspective. The sociological analysis of women's status and the psychological impact of polygamy (such as emotional trauma and instability) are relevant and logically connected to the thesis. However, these claims are presented largely in normative terms without empirical data. Since the study claims to be multidisciplinary, it would benefit from statistical evidence, case studies, or empirical research findings to substantiate assertions about depression, dependency, and family conflict.

In the discussion of patriarchy, the article effectively presents Wadud's critique of male-dominated exegesis and her call for women as subjects of interpretation. The argument that polygamy reflects a masculine system of exploitation aligns with Wadud's feminist theological framework. The proposal to reinterpret qiwamah (Q.S. An-Nisa:34) as shared responsibility rather than male dominance is a strong conceptual extension. However, at times the language becomes advocacy-oriented rather than analytical, particularly when describing polygamy as "structural oppression that must be abolished." Academic tone would be strengthened by balancing normative claims with critical engagement of counterarguments from classical fiqh traditions.

The conclusion restates the central findings clearly: polygamy, when examined through multidisciplinary analysis and Wadud's hermeneutics, appears inconsistent with contemporary understandings of justice and gender equality. The recommendation for legal reform of Article 57 of the KHI and the promotion of inclusive ijihad logically follow from the argument developed throughout the paper. However, the conclusion could more explicitly acknowledge limitations such as reliance on textual analysis rather than field research and suggest clearer directions for empirical follow-up studies. In terms of strengths, the paper demonstrates conceptual coherence, relevant engagement with contemporary gender discourse, and an accurate representation of Amina Wadud's feminist hermeneutics. It successfully integrates Qur'anic exegesis with socio-legal analysis and addresses an issue of significant relevance in Indonesia. In terms of weaknesses, the study would benefit from stronger methodological clarity, empirical support for multidisciplinary claims, deeper engagement with opposing theological arguments, and more careful academic tone in certain evaluative statements.

Overall, the paper presents a thoughtful and largely accurate analysis of polygamy through the lens of Amina Wadud's feminist theory. With refinement in structure, evidence integration, and critical balance, it has strong potential to contribute meaningfully to discussions on Islamic family law, gender justice, and contemporary Qur'anic interpretation.