

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: JNHST-048

Title: Political Awareness Among Male Students: A case study of University of Loralai.

Recommendation:

Accept after minor revision.....

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality			✓	
Clarity			✓	
Significance	✓			

Reviewer's ID: JPR-Abdul Haseeb Mir

Detailed Reviewer's Report

The manuscript under review investigates an important, localized, yet scalable dimension of political sociology: the level of political awareness and civic participation among male undergraduate and postgraduate students at the University of Loralai in Balochistan, Pakistan. The author properly frames the inquiry around the critical role that higher education institutions play as engines of political socialization, particularly in historically marginalized or developing regions where youth civic engagement is central to democratic consolidation. The sociopolitical significance of this study rests on its exploration of how youth in a sub-regional academic environment navigate information networks, interpret democratic values, and translate political knowledge into actual civic duties like voting and community debates.

By evaluating this cohort, the paper addresses a major gap in contemporary South Asian political studies, which frequently focus on elite urban universities while overlooking rural or developing provincial campuses. The scope of the paper successfully spans the continuum of political socialization, mapping out the primary informational drivers—such as formal classroom education and digital social media platform usage—against institutional and personal barriers, including widespread apathy and political alienation, that suppress active democratic participation among the student body.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Methodologically, the study adopts a qualitative, descriptive case study design, which is highly appropriate given the exploratory nature of the research question and the focus on understanding personal student perspectives. Data collection was executed using semi-structured interviews with a purposive sample of sixteen male students, a sample size that allows for a deep look into individual narratives within a specific campus environment. The qualitative synthesis succeeds in breaking down the student population into three distinct categories: a low-awareness group with minimal civic knowledge, a moderate-awareness group whose understanding is shaped by casual social discussions, and a high-awareness minority that actively participates in formal political debates and voting.

The author displays a strong awareness of foundational social theories, explicitly utilizing Political Socialization Theory and Political Knowledge frameworks to explain how different socio-environmental backgrounds affect a student's civic consciousness. However, to meet the publication standards of a premier international journal, the manuscript's methodological documentation requires a significant upgrade. The qualitative framework currently lacks explicit descriptions of the thematic analysis process, coding steps, and measures taken to ensure data trustworthiness, which leaves the empirical foundation looking somewhat descriptive rather than deeply analytical.

The central thesis of the manuscript posits that a student's level of political awareness acts as a direct, positive driver of their civic participation, and that the modern university campus functions as a vital site for reshaping or amplifying these political behaviors. The author constructs this argument by showing how formal academic exposure and active engagement with digital media successfully counteract traditional, passive family-based political alignments.

Operating through the conceptual lens of modern democratic theory, the paper highlights media influence, demonstrating how digital networks have democratized access to political information outside of traditional state-controlled channels. From a civic standpoint, the manuscript offers a realistic look at the psychological barriers to engagement, correctly identifying general lack of interest and institutional distrust as the primary forces driving student apathy. The paper effectively concludes that building a stable democratic culture requires moving past rote academic instruction and implementing active civic education frameworks, structured campus debates, and deliberate media strategies to transform passive students into responsible, active citizens.

Recommendations for Manuscript Improvement**Clarifying the Methodological Protocol and Thematic Analysis Steps**

The primary and most critical recommendation to elevate the manuscript's academic rigor is the explicit elaboration of the qualitative methodology section. The current draft states that data were collected from

REVIEWER'S REPORT

sixteen interviews but fails to explain the precise steps used to analyze the resulting transcripts. The author should thoroughly revise the methods section to detail the exact thematic analysis framework employed, such as Braun and Clarke's six-step methodology. The text must explicitly describe the initial coding process, how those codes were grouped into broader conceptual themes, and how the final thematic framework was verified against the raw interview data. Additionally, adding details on data saturation criteria and the measures taken to prevent researcher bias will protect the study from criticisms regarding a lack of qualitative objectivity.

Expanding the Analytical Scope to Address the Gender Imbalance

While the case study explicitly focuses on male students in its title and participant selection, the narrative does not provide a clear academic justification for excluding female students from the research cohort. In contemporary political sociology, studying a single gender without explaining the choice leaves the research design incomplete. The author needs to add a dedicated section in the introduction or methodology clarifying this focus. The author should explain whether the male-only sample was chosen due to structural campus access limitations, specific local cultural dynamics that restrict research permissions with female students, or an intentional research focus on male political socialization patterns in Balochistan. Providing this context is necessary to justify the sample design and clarify the boundaries of the study's conclusions.

Integrating Local Socio-Political and Regional Context

The current text treats the University of Loralai as an isolated academic space, largely ignoring the unique socio-political, ethnic, and historical realities of Balochistan that directly shape student consciousness. To improve the manuscript's analytical depth, the author must weave regional context into the discussion section. The narrative should explore how local tribal governance models, regional political parties, security dynamics, and economic development challenges influence how students interpret national democratic values. Analyzing how these external regional realities interact with campus-based media consumption will elevate the paper from a generic institutional study into a rich, context-specific piece of political scholarship.

Deepening the Theoretical Critique of Social Media Platforms

While the paper correctly identifies social media as a powerful tool for building political awareness, it treats digital media as a purely positive source of objective information. The author should expand this analysis by introducing a critical evaluation of modern digital environments. The updated text needs to address how algorithmic echo chambers, hyper-partisan online media, and coordinated disinformation campaigns can distort political awareness, sometimes fueling radical polarization or systemic cynicism

REVIEWER'S REPORT

rather than constructive civic responsibility. Exploring this dual nature of digital political socialization will add welcome nuance to the paper's theoretical framework.

Standardizing the Bibliographic Metadata and Completing Citations

A careful review of the concluding reference bibliography reveals several incomplete citations, missing metadata fields, and formatting inconsistencies, particularly within the recent 2026 entries on political motivation. Multiple listings are completely missing essential publication details, such as journal volume designations, issue numbers, precise page ranges, or valid digital object identifiers (DOIs), while several entries feature incomplete publisher data. The author must systematically audit the entire reference list to complete these missing elements and ensure that every citation conforms perfectly to a single, standardized style manual, such as the APA seventh edition. This standardization is mandatory for the paper to be indexed properly in international social science and political databases.

Cleaning Minor Typographical and Layout Presentation Flaws

Finally, the review copy features minor mechanical formatting shifts, uneven line spacing around major section boundaries, and occasional paragraph alignment errors that affect its professional presentation. There are a few instances where punctuation marks are placed incorrectly next to in-text citations, along with minor typing slips within the introductory abstract and keywords. The author must manually proofread the entire document to eliminate these visual artifacts. Ensuring that the manuscript possesses a flawless visual layout will provide a polished, highly professional appearance that matches the structural importance of its sociological data.

Editorial Recommendation

This manuscript is recommended for **publication with minor revisions**. The author has selected a highly valuable, original, and timely topic by investigating the dynamics of youth political socialization within a developing provincial university setting in Pakistan. The qualitative case study approach is well-conceived, the tripartite categorization of student awareness is analytical, and the emphasis on the interaction between media usage and civic apathy addresses a clear need in modern political education literature.

The manuscript offers a strong, insightful baseline for understanding youth civic consciousness. Once the author addresses the minor visual layout issues, explicitly details the thematic coding steps, provides a clear justification for the male-centric research design, and standardizes the incomplete bibliographic metadata, this manuscript will be a strong, highly analytical, and impactful addition to the journal's portfolio of political sociology scholarship.