

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: JNHST-019

Title: Faith, Vocation, and Professional Identity in Secular Societies: An Interdisciplinary Review

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
- Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*) ..

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	...			
Techn. Quality	...			
Clarity		...		
Significance	...			

Reviewer's ID: JNJST-06

Detailed Reviewer's Report

The paper titled “**Faith, Vocation, and Professional Identity in Secular Societies: An Interdisciplinary Review**” presents a well-structured and intellectually rigorous exploration of the intersection between religious belief and professional identity. The central argument of the paper is that religion, despite being marginalized in dominant sociological and organizational theories, continues to play a significant role in shaping the motivations, ethical frameworks, and identity constructions of professionals working in secular environments. The author effectively identifies a critical gap in existing literature and positions the study as an important corrective to the neglect of religion as an analytical variable in occupational research. The introduction successfully contextualizes the study within the broader framework of secularization theory, challenging the classical assumption that religion has retreated entirely into the private sphere. Instead, the paper argues that religion has been repositioned rather than eliminated, especially within professional domains such as healthcare, education, and social work. This argument is compelling and well-supported, as the author highlights how faith continues to influence practitioners’ understanding of purpose, suffering, and ethical dilemmas. The clarity of the research problem and the justification for the review establish a strong foundation for the subsequent analysis.

The theoretical framework is one of the strongest aspects of the paper. By integrating perspectives from Weber, Bourdieu, and identity theory, the author constructs a multidimensional lens through which the relationship between faith and professional life can be understood. Weber’s concept of vocation is effectively used to explain how work can be experienced as a calling, while Bourdieu’s notions of field, habitus, and capital illuminate the structural constraints faced by religious professionals in secular institutions. Additionally, identity theory and meaning-making models provide psychological depth to the discussion, explaining how individuals negotiate conflicting identities. This interdisciplinary synthesis is both coherent and analytically rich, significantly enhancing the paper’s theoretical contribution.

The discussion on privatization pressure is particularly insightful. The paper convincingly demonstrates how secular professional cultures implicitly discourage the expression of religious identity, forcing individuals to engage in self-censorship and identity management. The analysis of stigma and identity management further enriches the paper by focusing on the micro-level experiences of professionals. Drawing on Goffman’s theory, the author explains how religious individuals strategically manage the visibility of their identity through concealment, selective disclosure, or integration. The discussion is detailed and grounded in empirical research, highlighting the psychological costs of hiding one’s identity as well as the risks associated with disclosure. This section effectively captures the complexity of navigating religious identity in secular workplaces and contributes to a deeper understanding of workplace diversity and inclusion.

The proposed integrative framework is a valuable contribution, as it synthesizes the findings into a coherent model based on field compatibility, identity salience, and meaning integration. This framework not only organizes the existing literature but also offers a practical tool for analyzing different professional contexts. It demonstrates how structural conditions and individual factors interact to shape outcomes such as wellbeing and burnout. The

REVIEWER'S REPORT

model is logically developed and has clear implications for both theory and practice, particularly in designing organizational policies that acknowledge diverse sources of motivation.

In conclusion, the paper is a comprehensive and insightful review that makes a significant contribution to the study of professional identity. Its interdisciplinary approach, strong theoretical grounding, and integration of empirical evidence make it both academically robust and practically relevant. However, the paper could be further strengthened by incorporating more diverse religious perspectives beyond predominantly Christian contexts and by including more global, non-Western data. Overall, it successfully highlights the importance of religion as a neglected yet influential factor in professional life and opens new avenues for future research in this field.