

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: JNAVES-017

Title: Effect of castration and dietary protein levels on carcass measurements and carcass composition of male desert goats.

Recommendation:

Accept as it is

Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality			X	
Techn. Quality			X	
Clarity		X		
Significance			X	

Reviewer's ID: JPR-Dr Hari Prashad Joshi

Detailed Reviewer's Report

This study examines the effects of castration and dietary protein levels on carcass measurements and composition in male desert goats. While the topic is relevant to small ruminant production in arid regions, the manuscript has several fundamental flaws requiring major revision.

First, the language is unclear and contains numerous grammatical errors, making sections difficult to follow. Extensive editing is required. Second, the methodology is inadequately described: the number of animals per treatment and the duration of the feeding trial are not clearly stated. Third, the statistical analysis is poorly reported; the authors cite "Statistics 8" without describing the specific ANOVA model or the post-hoc tests used. The interaction effects are presented without clear interpretation. Fourth, Tables 2 and 4 are poorly formatted and difficult to interpret; values for standard errors and significance levels are jumbled. Fifth, the discussion lacks critical synthesis and relies heavily on comparisons with previous studies without explaining discrepancies. Sixth, the conclusion overstates findings given the non-significant results for most parameters. The authors must clarify the methodology, improve statistical reporting, restructure tables, and provide a more balanced discussion. A major revision is essential.